



ESCUP

September 2008



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



ESCUP Final Report

Educational Support to Children in Underserved Populations (Cambodia)



Submitted by:
American Institutes for Research

With:
World Education, Inc.

and
Kampuchean Action for Primary Education (KAPE)
CARE International

U.S. Agency for International Development
Cooperative Agreement No. GDG-A-00-03-00006-00
Associate Cooperative Agreement No. 442-A-00-05-00004-00

American Institutes for Research
1000 Thomas Jefferson St. NW
Washington, DC 20007
www.equip123.net



ESCUP Final Report (2005 - 2008)

Contents

1.	Executive Summary.....	iv
2.	Overview Of Program Scope, Structure, And Strategies.....	1
2.1	Background.....	1
2.2	Development Hypothesis	1
2.3	Technical Approach and Program Design.....	2
2.4	Target Areas and Coverage	3
3.	Progress And Verifiable Achievement Of Results.....	3
3.1	The Means Used to Measure Success and Illustrative Outcomes.....	3
	3.1.1 <u>Access and Quality Component</u>	
	3.1.2 <u>Teacher Education Component</u>	
	3.1.3 <u>School Community Partnerships Component</u>	
3.2	Overview of Achievement of Performance Indicators.....	7
	3.2.1 <u>Program-wide Review of PMP Indicators</u>	
	3.2.2 <u>Program-wide Review of OP Indicators</u>	
	3.2.3 <u>Performance in the Access and Quality Component</u>	
	3.2.4 <u>Performance in the Teacher Education Component</u>	
	3.2.5 <u>Performance in the School-Community Partnership Component</u>	
	3.2.6 <u>Performance in the Program Management Component</u>	
3.3	Overview of Program Activities Employed to Achieve Intermediate Results.....	13
4.	Key Elements of Success and the Constraints Encountered.....	15
4.1	Key Program Achievements.....	15
	4.1.1 <u>Developing a Hybrid Program Model</u>	
	4.1.2 <u>Addressing Teacher Shortages</u>	
	4.1.3 <u>Adding Grade Levels to Target Schools and Extending Educational Access</u>	
4.2	Constraints in Program Implementation.....	17
	4.2.1 <u>Impacts of the Census and National Elections on School Functioning</u>	
	4.2.2 <u>Governance Issues and their Role in Program Implementation</u>	
	4.2.3 <u>Price Inflation and Impacts on Grant Activities</u>	
	4.2.4 <u>Obstacles to Achieving Impacts on Classroom Practice</u>	
	4.2.5 <u>Long-term Time Frame Required for Change in Schools</u>	
	4.2.6 <u>Posting of First Batch of PTTC Graduates to Communes of Origin</u>	
	4.2.7 <u>Attrition of CFS Classroom Teachers</u>	
	4.2.8 <u>Selection of CFS Experimental Classroom Teachers during Year 3</u>	
4.3	Important Lessons Learned.....	21
	4.3.1 <u>Diversifying Interventions according to School Capacity and Links with Governance Issues</u>	
	4.3.2 <u>The Need for a Flexible Project Design</u>	
	4.3.3 <u>Using Stakeholder-driven Program Models</u>	
	4.1.4 <u>Extending Educational Access to Un-Served Communities</u>	
5.	Sustainability Issues.....	22

6.	Conclusions And Recommendations.....	24
6.1	General Overview.....	24
6.2	Areas to Address in Future Programming.....	25
	6.2.1 <u>Supply-Demand Side Constraints and Their Relation to Workplace Skills Training</u>	
	6.2.2 <u>Addressing the Need for Improved School Governance</u>	
	6.2.3 <u>Addressing Certain Prerequisites as a Precondition for Development</u>	
	6.2.4 <u>Adopting a Multi-Tiered Approach to Development</u>	

ANNEX 1: Performance Monitoring Plan

ANNEX 2: Operational Plan Indicators

List of Tables

Table 3.1:	Selected Activities Leading to the Identification of Children at Risk
Table 3.2:	Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions
Table 3.3:	Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions Relating to Learning Achievement
Table 3.4:	Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions Relating to Educational Relevance
Table 3.5:	Average Scores for Classroom Performance among CFS Classroom Teachers by Technical Area, 2007/8
Table 3.6:	Sex and Ethnicity among Selected PTTC Scholarship Candidates for All Intakes, 2005-08
Table 3.7:	School Participation in Designed Activity Channels by Province, 2007/8
Table 3.8:	Change in Household Responses Regarding Educational Service Provision, 2007 (N=152)
Table 3.9:	Summary of Progress against PMP Performance Indicators
Table 3.10:	Summary of Progress against PMP Performance Indicators (Year 3)
Table 3.11:	Summary of School Grant Provisions and Overall Fund Utilization Rates, 2005-08
Table 3.12	Student Beneficiaries at Primary Level, Year 3
Table 6.1:	Summary of PMP Indicator Status

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1 Overview

The EQUIP1/Cambodia Educational Support to Children in Underserved Populations (ESCUP) Program is a USAID funded initiative designed to improve access to a basic education of quality for marginal groups in Cambodia—namely, ethnic minority children, girls, disabled children, and the poor. This program began in mid-2005 and was extended in April 2007 for an additional 18 months, leading to the designation of the last phase of the program’s implementation as ESCUP II. ESCUP interventions are implemented in four large adjacent provinces in eastern Cambodia: Kampong Cham, Kratie, Monduliri, and most recently, Ratanakiri. Across these four provinces, the program is supporting a total of 167 primary schools from 22 school clusters and 19 lower secondary schools. The overall program design has three overarching technical components—Access and Quality, Teacher Education, and School-Community Partnerships, and a fourth component, Program Management. The program’s technical approach includes (i) using cluster and secondary school grants as a means of resourcing schools, (ii) using activity menus in the development of school improvement plans, and (iii) utilizing local committees such as Local Cluster School Committees (LCSCs) to implement activities on the ground. Overall, the program seeks to promote the government’s recent adoption of Child Friendly Schools (CFS) as a front line strategy to improve quality in the basic education sector (i.e., Grades 1-9).

The ESCUP Program was created in order to respond to USAID/Cambodia Strategic Objective (SO) 11, which seeks to improve the Access, Quality and Relevance of Basic Education, which is defined as Grades 1 to 9. Linked with this Strategic Objective is the Intermediate Result (IR) 3: “Increased access to quality basic education and training for *underserved* groups.” The underlying *development hypothesis* of the program’s approach was that in order to achieve access to a basic education of relevance and quality, one has to simultaneously address a myriad of both *demand* and *supply-side* constraints. The development hypothesis of ESCUP is articulated through 11 Intermediate Results across four Program Components (see below). Eight of the 11 results are considered technical IRs, as they have been formulated to link directly with the SO. The remaining three IRs are formulated to provide management support for the achievement of the primary technical IRs.

The present report documents the degree to which the ESCUP has reached mutually agreed performance standards and what lessons were learned during the course of program implementation. The report is cumulative in its focus and analyzes performance during the period April 2005 to September 2008. In all, there are 49 performance targets stated in the program’s Performance and Monitoring Plan (PMP) and 12 indicators under USAID’s Operational Plan (OP) that are discussed in detail in this report.

1.2 Key Outcomes

A review of the PMP indicators described in this report indicates that 42 indicators have been fully achieved or nearly so, within a margin of two or three percentage points. This comprises about 86% of the indicators stated in the PMP. The successful achievement of performance standards has been most evident in the area of promoting access and increasing educational efficiency (i.e., reducing dropout and repetition). For example, 72% of schools reported reducing repetition rates and 76% reported reducing dropout in comparison to baseline levels in Year 3. Outreach to minority communities, strategies to reduce PTR levels and ease teacher shortages, scholarship support, health outreach to the physically challenged, Intermediate Classrooms, and life skills provisions have all played a major role in this success. Another 8% of indicators have been partially achieved.

There were only four indicators that were not achieved outright or about 8% of the total. These indicators mostly dealt with ambitious minority quotas and a higher performance standard for expanded provision of life skills courses. With respect to the former, the program had an ambitious target of ensuring that 35% of Community Teachers and PTTC recruits with scholarship support were of mi-

nority extraction. In the actual event, only about 24% of Community Teachers were from minority groups while 11% of PTTC students were. Two other indicators that were not achieved related to promotion levels among Grade 5 and 6 children. Although 72% of schools reported an improvement in their overall rates of student promotion across all grades, the numerical targets set for promotion in Grades 5 and 6 proved to be too ambitious.

In terms of life skills provision indicators that were only partially achieved, ESCUP sought to double its performance standard from 25% coverage under ESCUP I to at least 50% under the last phase of programming. In the actual event, coverage did improve significantly from 27% of schools in Year 2 to 38% in Year 3 (or a 41% expansion), but still short of the hoped for goal.

ESCUP also demonstrated reasonably strong progress towards the achievement of OP indicators. A number of OP indicators did not have targets specified in Year 3 due to the nature of the interventions such as ICR construction, which only occurred in Year 2 of program implementation. Grade 5 and 6 promotion numbers were not specified in Year 3, as it was agreed that it would be difficult to meet expectations in this area with only three years of programming. Of the remaining nine indicators for which targets were specified, ESCUP achieved or nearly achieved eight or 89% with one performance indicator (life skills coverage) classified as only partly achieved.

1.3 Important Lessons Learned

There are several key lessons learned under the ESCUP Program that will prove to be very useful for future programming.

Diversifying Interventions according to School Capacity and Links with Governance Issues: **Selective implementation and the use of school governance criteria** in development has been an important lesson learned under the current USAID-AIR-World Education partnership. Different localities are not the same in their receptivity to development initiatives or their ability to utilize funds with professional integrity. Professionalism and good management practices among school directors and teachers are often lacking, which invite serious risks for development investment. In this regard, current programming has not adequately distinguished between schools with strong management capacity, those with medium levels of management capacity, and those that are dysfunctional due to the low integrity of the individuals that manage them. Schools in the latter category should be passed over for assistance unless the local education authority can make changes in personnel to reduce the risks involved with assistance. Schools in the other two categories should receive modulated forms of assistance that are commensurate with their management capacity.

The Need for a Flexible Project Design: A **flexible project design** allows local stakeholders to develop their own programming content based on their own perceived needs. Under the current USAID-funded Program, local stakeholders received extensive technical support for needs analysis and objective-based planning that enabled them to determine what they needed to change in their schools/communities and how they might effect these changes. When development is stakeholder driven in this way, it ensures local ownership and engagement in programming, which in turn increases the likelihood for sustainability.

Using Stakeholder-driven Program Models: The use of **open-ended grants and activity menus** has gone hand-in-hand with stakeholder-driven development themes described earlier. The open-ended nature of the grants provided by the program empowers stakeholders and allows them to drive the development process. To be sure, programming grant funds is a negotiated process so that issues relating to government policy and donor interests can also be interjected into planning activities, mainly through awareness raising that is an integral part of capacity building activities. The use of Activity Menus, which cross-reference possible interventions to common problems, greatly helps to ensure that there is some structure in the planning process that echoes national policy themes such as children's rights, improved educational efficiency (e.g., reducing dropout), and the needs of underserved groups. Activity menus also address certain challenges in promoting stakeholder-driven development

that arise from the limited exposure of local stakeholders to different ways of doing things and years of conditioning that discourages proactive management processes. Indeed, it should be noted that this conditioning, which underlies many of the dysfunctional behavior patterns at local level is not easily reversed. Often it requires two or more years of intensive capacity building for self-determination practices to firmly take root.

1.4 Areas to Address in Future Programming

Supply-Demand Side Constraints and Their Relation to Workplace Skills Training: Future programming should look at a key issue that seems to straddle the supply-side and demand-side divide. This refers to **the absence of a concrete curricular focus in the state schools on workplace readiness skills**. Workplace readiness skills are clearly a demand-side factor because they potentially represent an area of great concern not only among parents but also among young people themselves. The perception that school is not relevant to the world of work by many young people is clearly an issue that depresses educational demand. On the other hand, the fact that schools are not offering a curricular program that is relevant to workplace preparedness is also a supply-side issue since it is the schools that must make the needed changes to meet student needs and interests. There is much to be said about the likely potency of efforts to work with state schools to better highlight the curricular topics of great relevance to young people, such as workplace preparedness.

Addressing the Need for Improved School Governance: The MoEYS has identified “enabling environments” as a Sixth Dimension under the Child Friendly School (CFS) programming framework. This refers to the need to ensure that the management of schools supports and facilitates school improvement planning and implementation. When management capacity is lacking, investments in development are at serious risk due to misuse of funds, inadequate transparency, poor communication with communities, teachers, and students, and generally poor understanding of why interventions might be needed. Management capacity among schools is highly variable, which requires careful assessment before site identification (and possible rejection of a site) as well as the implementation of properly designed capacity building activities aimed at improving management potential (where such potential exists).

Addressing Certain Prerequisites as a Precondition for Development: One of the important experiences during ESCUP implementation in education has been the realization of the need to modulate assistance based on a school’s readiness to receive development aid. Necessary prerequisites for assistance include: (i) reasonable class sizes and teacher availability; (ii) community engagement; (iii) equal access for marginalized groups including minorities, girls, and the physically challenged; (iv) cultural sensitivity to minority needs where such minority groups exist; and (v) basic infrastructure.

Adopting a Multi-Tiered Approach to Development: Because the readiness of schools to receive development assistance is likely to be highly variable depending on external conditions described above, programming interventions need to be modulated to match these different operating conditions. Some schools may demonstrate a high level of readiness to receive interventions designed to promote ‘excellence’ in learning and teaching. These interventions may include intensive activities aimed at improving classroom environments, IT instruction, or advanced life skills programming.

2. OVERVIEW OF PROGRAM SCOPE, STRUCTURE, AND STRATEGIES

2.1 Background

The Educational Support to Children in Underserved Populations program (ESCUP) began in April 2005 as an initiative of several international and local NGOs, in collaboration with the Royal Cambodian Government, to extend Child Friendly School development models into remote and underserved areas of Cambodia. The program has completed a period of funding support of three and a half years in two distinct phases known as ESCUP I (24 months) and ESCUP II (18 months). Approximately \$4.5 million was provided by USAID for program implementation during the funding period. The program was implemented through the EQUIP1 mechanism as an Associate Award with the American Institutes for Research (AIR), based in Washington DC, as the prime contractor and World Education as the primary subcontractor, which implements the program directly in Cambodia.

World Education works closely with a local partner called Kampuchean Action for Primary Education (KAPE), whose role has been increasing as part of the program's intensified efforts to increase local capacity. In addition to Kampong Cham Province, where KAPE has primary responsibility for program implementation, World Education has also asked KAPE to field technical teams in Kratie and Monduliri Provinces to work side by side with World Education staff members, thereby increasing the technical role of this local partner across all provinces. CARE International in Cambodia is also a member of the ESCUP alliance and has made significant technical contributions to the program in the area of bilingual education where it is a lead agency in Cambodia. CARE also assisted the program to expand Child Friendly School programming to five secondary schools in Ratanakiri Province. There are also three other local NGOs affiliated with the program who have provided specialized support in various technical areas including mobilization of the Muslim community (Cambodian Islamic Youth Association), support to hill tribe groups (Cambodia Corps, Inc), and implementation of scholarship programs (Women and Children's Rights Development).

With agreement from USAID, the ESCUP Program was extended for a second phase of implementation that began in April 2007 and reached a final conclusion in September 2008. The extension from USAID enabled the program to complete support to schools for the 2006/7 academic year and provide additional support for the 2007/8 academic year. Thus, target schools received in total three years of support (i.e., support over three complete academic years). ESCUP II has seen a number of important modifications in program focus. These include (i) a higher profile for governance issues so that continued program support is closely linked with performance and probity in the use of program funds; (ii) shifting support for several key interventions (such as measures to address teacher shortages) to government; and (iii) intensified support for Child Friendly Secondary Schools (CFSS), where USAID is the only active donor providing assistance in this area.

2.2 The Development Hypothesis

The ESCUP Program was created in order to respond to USAID/Cambodia Strategic Objective (SO) 11, which seeks to improve the Access, Quality and Relevancy of Basic Education, which is defined as Grades 1 to 9. Linked with this Strategic Objective is the Intermediate Result (IR) 3: "Increased access to quality basic education and training for *underserved* groups." The underlying *development hypothesis* of the program's approach was that in order to achieve access to a basic education of relevance and quality, one has to simultaneously address a myriad of both *demand* and *supply-side* constraints. Demand-side constraints are those that depress the demand for education such as low motivation to attend, lack of funds to pay for direct costs, or language barriers among others; supply-side constraints on the other hand refer to factors that limit the availability of education such as lack of teachers, classrooms, or textbooks. Historically, development programs in the education sector have focused almost exclusively on supply-side factors such as construction or training teachers. A seminal research study implemented by KAPE and funded by UNICEF/Sida at the beginning of the decade found that school efficiency indicators in Cambodia such as student repetition had not changed appreciably during the last decade because donors and Government had generally neglected any focus

on demand-side factors.¹ That is, supply-side interventions had had minimal effect because the most vulnerable children whom they sought to benefit did not enrol or if they did, did not stay for long. These findings led to the adoption of a multi-dimensional approach to educational development under UNICEF-KAPE programming that took in both demand and supply-side factors as part of the Child Friendly School Pilot Program in 2001. This approach was in turn adopted in full by AIR, World Education, and KAPE during the design phase of ESCUP in 2004. Thus, the ESCUP Program approach encompasses a hybridized project design based on sound empirical evidence and earlier experience that justifies the strategy embodied in its holistic programming framework.

The development hypothesis of ESCUP is articulated through 11 Intermediate Results across four Program Components (see below). Eight of the 11 results are considered technical IRs, as they have been formulated to link directly with the SO. The remaining three IRs are formulated to provide management support for the achievement of the primary technical IRs.

2.3 Technical Approach and Program Design

Key Approaches: The technical approach under ESCUP II is largely the same as that used during the program's first phase of implementation, though there have been some modifications in design as well (see Program Design below). As implied above, ESCUP has built extensively on work done under the Child Friendly School (CFS) Initiative supported by UNICEF/Sida and KAPE as well as life skills programming supported by World Education under the OPTIONS Program. The key principle in CFS programming is to avoid stand-alone interventions and to **approach school development holistically** across multiple dimensions including (i) inclusive education; (ii) psychosocial learning environments; (iii) good health and nutrition; (iv) gender sensitivity; (v) parental and community engagement; and (vi) good school governance. ESCUP program implementation has relied heavily on the use of school clusters, which are formal groupings of schools overseen by a Local Cluster School Committee (LCSC). **The organization of schools into clusters** by MoEYS helps to simplify communication between program and schools and greatly expedites the ability of programs such as ESCUP to maximize coverage and increase penetration of rural areas. At secondary school level, the program has relied on local school management committees that represent school personnel, community members, and local authorities. The use of local committees for implementation in this way has greatly facilitated the stakeholder-driven element in program design. The program's technical approach also includes (i) the use of cluster and secondary *school grants* as a means of resourcing schools, (ii) the use of *activity menus* in the development of school improvement plans, and (iii) *utilization of local committees* such as Local Cluster School Committees (LCSCs) to implement activities on the ground, as noted earlier. Under ESCUP II, the use of school grants has begun a scaling back process in keeping with a greater focus on sustainability.

Program Design: Overall program design comprised three overarching technical components that included **Access and Quality, Teacher Education, and School-Community Partnerships**. A fourth component was responsible for **Program Management**. Under ESCUP II, a cross-component team of agricultural specialists from World Education was also added to the program to intensify the provision of Integrated Pest Management (IPM) activities. Another important change in design under ESCUP II was the addition of several staff members who focused primarily on secondary education interventions in order to support the development of an improved CFSS implementation framework. Interventions implemented under each component often overlap, highlighting the complementarities of activities. As noted above, each component was associated with a number of Intermediate Results with ancillary indicators that measured the achievement of each result. These indicators comprised what is known as the Performance Monitoring Plan (PMP) (see Annex 1). In all, the program identified 42 technical indicators. In addition, there are seven indicators that define performance standards for the Program Management Component for a total of 49 indicators in all. The program also reports against 12 Operational Plan (OP) Indicators, which are global performance standards required by USAID for reporting to the US Congress. Several of the OP indicators are also included in the PMP as well, so

¹ Bredenberg, K. (2000) *Student Repetition in Cambodia: Causes, Consequences, and Its Relationship to Learning*, Phnom Penh: UNICEF-Sida.

that there is some overlap between the two sets of indicators.

Implementation Approaches: One of the key features of ESCUP programming has been its **flexible project design**, which allows local stakeholders to develop their own programming content based on their own perceived needs. Open-ended school grants and structured activity menus are key elements of this flexible design. This approach facilitates a very **stakeholder-driven** program as opposed to one that is top down and prescriptive. In order to assist stakeholders in programming available funds by themselves, ESCUP provides extensive technical support for needs analysis and objective-based planning that enable stakeholders to determine what they need to change in their schools/communities and how they might effect these changes. When development is stakeholder driven in this way, it ensures local ownership, which in turn increases the likelihood for sustainability once program support is phased out. This simple logic is often lost in many projects in the education sector where ‘one size fits all’ approaches imposed from above tend to be the norm. This key aspect of its programming has set ESCUP apart from most other programs in Cambodia and has been perhaps the most important reason for its success.

2.4 Target Areas and Coverage

ESCUP has been characterized by a regional as opposed a national implementation framework that focuses on provinces in northeastern Cambodia. To be sure, the program has worked within the CFS and EFA policy framework of the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport and has sought to both promote and strengthen the implementation of these policies. Under ESCUP I, there were three provinces receiving support; namely Kampong Cham, Kratie, and Monduliri Provinces. As noted above, a fourth province (Ratanakiri) was added to the coverage area under ESCUP II with assistance from CARE International. During the third year of program operation, the program was able to reach 167 primary schools and 19 lower secondary schools comprising 61,743 children. The number of assisted primary schools increased slightly from ESCUP I when 164 schools were receiving support. Similarly, the number of assisted lower secondary schools increased from 14 to 19, mainly due to the assistance provided to five new schools in Ratanakiri. In the last academic year of the program, total enrolment at both primary and secondary school level in target areas decreased slightly from 62,317 children in Year 2 to the present 61,743 or a decline of less than 1%. This reflects a demographic dip in the population that is occurring nationwide.

3. PROGRESS AND VERIFIABLE ACHIEVEMENT OF RESULTS

3.1 The Means Used to Measure Success and Illustrative Outcomes

Successful implementation of the ESCUP Program in its technical aspects has been defined primarily by achievement of the eight technical Intermediate Results noted above. The achievement of these results is in turn defined by associated indicators. Below is a list of programmatic Intermediate Results by Technical Component followed by a brief analysis of their causal links to USAID IR3 and hence SO11 as well as illustrative outcomes suggesting the magnitude of success. More detailed data on the achievement of results can be found in later sections of this report.

3.1.1 Access and Quality Component

Intermediate Result A: Schools and clusters are able to identify children at risk (both in and out of school) using the appropriate criteria for selection.

A key result under the Access and Quality Component relates to the identification and tracking of children in vulnerable groups. This provides the justification for Intermediate Result A. Tracking and identification often entail specialized surveys that rely on school personnel as well as members of the local community. For example, ESCUP has used community-mapping activities with schools and clusters to identify children who are out of school or at risk and to identify what support they need in order to enroll in or remain in school. Other important survey activities leading to the identification of

children at risk include health screening and scholarship surveys among others. Outcomes of these survey activities are summarized in Table 3.1 below. The identification of children out-of-school or otherwise at risk strongly links with IR3 of USAID’s strategic planning framework, as it is a pre-condition for helping such children gain increased access to the education system.

Table 3.1: Selected Activities Leading to the Identification of Children at Risk

Intervention	Year 1 (total/girls)	Year 2 (total/girls)	Year 3 (total/girls)
School Mapping (% of schools)	77%	100%	98%
Out-of-School Children Identified	1,740/737	2,543/1,217	1,346/639
Health Screening	1,839/502	--	--
Scholarship Surveys (Primary Level)	4,817/2,438	5,265/2,689	5,937/3,276
Scholarship Surveys (Secondary)	809/685	948/749	992/698

Intermediate Result B: Interventions designed to increase access and retention are implemented effectively.

Interventions implemented under Intermediate Result B/Access & Quality Component comprise the second piece to Intermediate Result A after children at risk have been identified. Once in school, retention requires additional interventions. Key enabling interventions in this regard include scholarships for the disadvantaged, school breakfasts², and school health referrals for the substantial number of children suffering from disabilities and chronic health problems. Other interventions include outreach to un-served communities through the provision of temporary classrooms (also known as intermediate classrooms or ICRs) and Community Teachers (CTs). These interventions increase penetration to underserved communities and enable incomplete schools to add a grade level, thereby delaying the need for a small child to walk to a more distant complete school to continue his or her education until they are older (when faced with this choice, most dropout). Such interventions have enhanced educational availability, addressed teacher shortages and reduced Pupil Teacher Ratios (PTRs), as well as reduced travel distances for young children. Both *access* and *retention* improve when classrooms are near communities (especially for young children) and when overcrowding (due to high PTRs) in classrooms decreases.

Evidence in the form of decreased dropout rates in target schools suggests there is a connection between retention and program interventions. Stakeholders have consistently reported the positive effect on retention of the scholarship program and school breakfasts. This indicates that a combination of activities has increased retention rates, i.e. more children are staying in school. The following findings highlighted in Table 3.2 below help validate these observations. This Intermediate Result, therefore, logically contributes to the achievement of the SO because access to basic education for the underserved has been increased. Children attend school who otherwise would not have without program assistance and fewer children are dropping out of target schools.

Table 3.2: Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions

Selected Outcomes	Outcome	Associated Interventions
Incomplete Schools adding a Grade (Yrs 1-3)	78%	ICR Construction, Community Teachers
Schools Reducing PTR (Years 1-3)	68%	Community Teachers
Out-of-school Children Enrolling (Yrs 1-3)	2,991/1,485 (total/girls)	ICR Construction, Scholarships
Schools Reducing Dropout from Baseline (Year 3)	76%	ICR Construction, Community Teachers, Scholarships, Health Referrals
Target Secondary Schools Reporting an Increase in Transition (Year 3)	76%	Secondary School Scholarships

² The School Breakfast Program is supported by World Food Program, which provides all food stuffs. ESCUP complements this assistance by providing one-time interventions for the construction of kitchens and hardware for cooking.

Intermediate Result C: Learning achievement of slow learners improves as a result of remedial interventions.

Outcomes under this result refer primarily to terminal learning achievement among those children receiving village-based remedial support. Remedial education for slow learners has increased retention. Overage enrollments and high repetition rates result in students having to spend more years in school. As children get older, the opportunity costs of staying in school increase, thereby raising the likelihood of dropping out of school. It is also assumed that poor performance in school, resulting in repeating grades, discourages children from remaining in school.

Table 3.3: Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions Relating to Learning Achievement

Selected Outcomes	Outcome
Schools Reducing Repetition Rate from Baseline	72%
Number of Failing Children Promoted to the Next Grade as a result of Remedial Support (Year 3)	Total: 2,613 Female: 1,267
Percentage of Failing Children Promoted to the Next Grade as a result of Remedial Support (Year 3)	Total: 66% Female: 82%

The provision of remedial teaching to students in need logically results in better school performance and thus increased quality and retention. This Intermediate Result, therefore, also clearly contributes to the SO. Impacts during the final year of program implementation are impressive with 72% of schools reporting declines in repetition rate since the baseline year (see Table 3.3).

Intermediate Result D: Educational provision in schools is more relevant to student needs.

Increasing educational relevance is in direct line with the Strategic Objective. A basic education of quality must result in students that have developed the knowledge and skills necessary for economic and social well being for themselves and families. The incorporation of life skills education and a richer learning environment into the teaching program in target schools makes the curriculum more relevant to student interests as well as needs. To assess this intermediate result, the program has developed a special standardized scale to assess relevance and has set targets for coverage of life skills programming. Coverage targets in each case were set to reach at least 50% of target schools. Selected outcomes for this Intermediate Result are summarized in Table 3.4.

Table 3.4: Selected Outcomes Validating the Effectiveness of Enabling Interventions Relating to Educational Relevance

Province	Outcome
Schools Scoring 'Satisfactory' on a Relevance Scale	78
% of Schools Scoring Satisfactory on a Relevance Scale	47%
Primary Schools Providing Life Skills Education	35%
Secondary Schools Providing Life Skills Education	58%

3.1.2 Teacher Education Component

Intermediate Result A: Classroom teaching practice becomes more child-centered in comparison to a previously established baseline.

Several program activities have sought to improve the quality of teaching and learning through introducing child-friendly (or centered) methods. Child-centered teaching is widely considered a key characteristic of a school characterized by standards of quality, thereby resulting in a direct link between the Intermediate Result and the Strategic Objective. In order to achieve this result, ESCUP trained a wide range of teachers in different capacities including Primary School CFS Teachers, Secondary School CFS Teachers, Community Teachers, Bilingual Classroom Assistants, and Supplementary Khmer Language Teachers. In all, over 800 teachers have

Table 3.5: Average Scores for Classroom Performance among CFS Classroom Teachers by Technical Area, 2007/8

Province	Classroom Environment	Teaching & Learning	Average Score
Kg Cham	82%	71%	74%
Kratie	95%	78%	52%
Mondulhiri	74%	52%	87%
Total	84%	71%	74%

*Satisfactory equals 65% or better on a standardized scale

been trained since the beginning of the program in 2005. Selected outcomes for this Intermediate Result as they relate to teacher performance are summarized in Table 3.5.

Intermediate Result B: The PTTCs and teacher education system are more responsive to the needs of remote communities.

Many rural and remote areas suffer from chronic teacher shortages. The lack of teachers is a primary supply-side constraint to educational access and also impacts on educational quality because it causes classroom overcrowding. A key strategy employed by the program to ensure sustainable teacher supply in rural and remote areas has been the local recruitment of teachers. If the teacher training system is more responsive to the needs of target communities, it will ensure provision of an adequate number of teachers to such areas, thereby increasing the number of teachers, thereby increasing educational access and quality. The program defines ‘responsiveness’ as accepting PTTC candidates recruited from remote areas and/or minority communities - even if they have lower qualifications than normally required – and ensuring their placement in their own community. These actions have been mediated in close cooperation with the Teacher Training Dept and Provincial Offices of Education in each province, which have ultimate responsibility for selection and posting. Local teacher recruitment, therefore, directly contributes to USAID’s IR3, critical to the sustainable achievement of the SO. Although a target of 35% minority representation among PTTC intakes was not achieved by the program, overall representation increased from a baseline of near ‘0’ (see Table 3.6).

Table 3.6: Sex and Ethnicity among Selected PTTC Scholarship Candidates for All Intakes, 2005-08

Province	Sex and Ethnicity of Passing PTTC Candidates in Years 1+2					Sex and Ethnicity of Passing PTTC Candidates in Year 3					Sex and Ethnicity of All Passing PTTC Candidates				
	Total	Female	Ethnic Minority	% Female	% Ethnic Minority	Total	Female	Ethnic Minority	% Female	% Ethnic Minority	Total	Female	Ethnic Minority	% Female	% Ethnic Minority
Kg. Cham	96	44	6	46%	6%	40	34	3	85%	8%	136	78	9	57%	7%
Kratié	52	20	3	38%	6%	0	0	0	0%	0%	52	20	3	38%	6%
M'kiri	21	6	11	29%	52%	0	0	0	0%	0%	21	6	11	29%	52%
Total	169	70	20	41%	12%	40	34	3	83%	8%	209	104	23	50%	11%

3.1.3 School Community Partnerships Component

Intermediate Result A: Communities demonstrate active participation in the instructional program of target schools.

Active participation of communities in the education system links strongly with demand-side factors that affect participation and educational quality. Program interventions have, therefore, sought to identify avenues through which communities can be more engaged in education, thereby helping the state schools to meet

local expectations with respect to both access and relevance. Community involvement contributes to the SO by supporting activities that lead to increased access and relevance. Such activities include teaching life skills classes, recruiting Community Teachers, and identifying children out-of-school (i.e., school mapping). Assessment of this intermediate result has been operationalized by quantifying the number of activity channels that communities have been engaged in and the extent of that

Table 3.7: School Participation in Designated Activity Channels by Province, 2007/8

Province	Total Schools	School Participating in:			
		Activity Channel 1: Local Life Skills Program	Activity Channel 2: Community Teacher Recruitment	Activity Channel 3: PTTC Recruitment	Activity Channel 4: Mapping
Kg Cham	91	29	45	25	88
Kratié	51	20	28	14	51
Mondulkiiri	25	10	18	7	25
Total	167	59	91	46	164
% for 2007/8	167	35%	54%	28%	98%
% for 2006/7	146	30%	84%	19%	100%

involvement in each (see Table 3.7).

Intermediate Result B: Schools are more sensitized to the diverse cultural needs of their students.

Complementing the need to increase community engagement is the need to make the education system itself more sensitized to the needs and expectations of communities, particularly with respect to minority groups. Making the education system more culturally responsive will logically increase engagement by stimulating demand. Interventions by ESCUP to work with schools and District Offices of Education to make schools more culturally responsive include the introduction of Cultural Life Skills training, Cultural Centers, Student Associations, and Market Simulations, which provide a forum for cultural displays. By impacting on demand-side constraints that impede engagement by minority groups, interventions under this Intermediate Result directly contribute to access and relevance goals stated under SO 11. Assessment of the degree to which schools have been more responsive to the diverse cultural needs of their students have been operationalized through attitudinal surveys in target areas that include both Khmer and minority households. Selected responding patterns from such surveys are presented in Table 3.8 below.

Table 3.8: Change in Household Responses Regarding Educational Service Provision, 2007 (N=152)

Cultural and Social Aspects of Schooling (minority households only)	2006/7 Responses	2007/8 Responses
1. Do you feel that the school is sensitive to children who come from non-Khmer ethnic backgrounds?		
o Yes	89%	94%
o No	4%	5%
o Don't know	7%	1%
2. Have you noticed any change in cultural sensitivity at school this academic year compared to previous years?		
o Yes	83%	89%
o No	17%	11%
3. Number of respondents who said they noticed the following changes:		
o Addition of Bilingual Classroom Assistants (BCA)	57%	67%
o More non-Khmer teachers	68%	63%
o Cultural life skills taught in school	68%	67%
o School director more responsive to ethnic minorities needs	64%	78%

3.2 Overview of Performance Indicators and Their Level Achievement

3.2.1 Program-wide Review of Indicators

As noted earlier, there are 49 performance indicators, which have been used to define the success of program implementation under ESCUP. These indicators comprise the official Performance Monitoring Plan approved by USAID. Table 3.9 below summarizes the final outcome for each indicator and the Intermediate Result with which it is associated. Those indicators, which are shaded in grey indicate a performance standard that has been *fully achieved* or *nearly achieved*, within a margin of 1 to 3%. Indicators, which are shaded yellow were only partly achieved, but nevertheless indicate some measure of success while those shaded in pink were not achieved.

Table 3.9: Summary of Progress against PMP Performance Indicators

Intermediate Results	Operational Indicator	Current Status
I. ACCESS AND QUALITY COMPONENT		
Result A: Schools and clusters are able to identify children at risk (both in and out-of-school) using the appropriate criteria for selection.	1. All target schools complete mapping exercises.	<u>Nearly achieved</u> at 98% compliance for Year 3. 100% compliance among schools that were part of the program at the beginning of 2007/8.
	2. 6,800 or more primary school children are identified in local surveys as being at risk and eligible for scholarship assistance.	<u>Achieved</u> . Over 6,814 children (3,742 female) were identified during Years 1-3.
	3. 900 children or more at lower secondary school level have been identified for eligibility for scholarship assistance.	<u>Achieved</u> . 992 children (698 female) received scholarships in Year 3.
	4. At least 25% of those targeted for scholarship assistance at all levels are from minority groups.	<u>Nearly Achieved</u> . Fully achieved at Primary Level with 26% minorities and nearly achieved at secondary level with 22% minorities.
	5. At least 1,100 disabled children identified in local surveys are targeted for service referral by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . 1,848 children (501 female) were identified for referral.

	6. 6,000 children or more with learning difficulties are identified for assistance at the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . Since Year 1, over 13,209 children (5,909 female) have received remedial support though this number includes overlap approximately 20% to 30% from year to year.
	7. Schools for interventions relating to language proficiency difficulties are identified.	<u>Achieved</u> . 24 schools were identified to achieve such interventions, of which all are receiving interventions.
Result B: Interventions designed to increase access and retention are implemented effectively.	8. At least 65% of primary schools report declines in dropout from baseline levels by the end of the project.	<u>Achieved for Years 1, 2, and 3</u> . In Year 1, 63% of schools reported such declines; in Year 2, 66% of schools reported such declines. An update for Year 3 indicated that 76% of schools reported such declines from the baseline year.
	9. At least 40% of those identified as being outside the school system (based on mapping results) are enrolled with scholarship support each year.	<u>Achieved for Years 2 and 3</u> . Although only 31% of such children were re-enrolled in Year 1, this increased to 60% in Year 2, and 68% in Year 3 (due mainly to ICRs).
	10. At least 60% of the children out of school who are enrolled are girls, disabled, or come from minority groups.	<u>Achieved</u> . 66% of those re-enrolled were from target groups.
	11. At least 6,800 children receive primary school scholarships in all grades during program implementation from 2005-08	<u>Achieved</u> . 6,814 children (3,742 female) have received scholarships during Year 1-3 implementation.
	12. Transition rates to lower secondary school increase from a baseline in 80% or more of target schools each year.	Partly Achieved . 76% of schools reported increasing their transition rate from the baseline.
	13. At least 85% of scholarship beneficiaries at all levels remain enrolled each yr.	<u>Achieved</u> . 96% of beneficiaries were retained at primary level and 91% at secondary level (Year 3).
	14. At least 500 disabled children identified in surveys receive some form of assistance from service providers by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . As of September 2008, 1,207 children (371 female) had received such assistance. This indicator greatly exceeded expectations.
	15. 80% or more of the disabled children who receive assistance stay enrolled each academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> . Of the 48 children with severe disabilities, all have remained enrolled as of Year 3.
	16. PTR declines in at least 75% of target schools by the end of Year 3.	Partly Achieved . 68% of schools reported such declines.
	17. 25% or more incomplete schools add at least 1 grade from baseline by end Yr 3.	<u>Achieved</u> . 78% of such schools have reported adding a grade since Year 1, far exceeding expectations.
	18. 75% of minority children receiving interventions designed to improve language proficiency stay in school each academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> . Dropout and repetition has declined in all schools where such interventions are being provided. On average, dropout declined by 5% and repetition declined by 10% from baseline.
	19. Children studying in new CFS classrooms at Grade 1 outperform children in comparable settings on achievement tests in core subject areas at the end of each academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> . Baseline completed in Year 2 in three grades. Test Results in Year 3 demonstrated noticeable improvement in 7 out of 8 thinking domains for Grades 5/6 and 3 out of 5 domains for Grade 1.
	20. At least 51,907 children are enrolled in USAID supported primary schools by 2007/8	<u>Nearly achieved</u> . 51,343 children (25,249 female) had been enrolled by Year 3.
	21. At least 10,194 children are enrolled in USAID supported secondary schools by 2007/8.	<u>Achieved</u> . 10,400 children (4,895 female) had enrolled in target secondary schools by Year 3.
	22. At least 6,370 children in Grade 5 in USAID supported schools complete the grade by the end of 2007/8	Not Achieved . 5,247 Grade 5 students passed in all sites in Year 3 representing 94% of the total.
23. At least 7,800 children in Grade 6 in USAID supported schools complete the primary cycle by the end of 2007/8	Not Achieved . 4,495 children passed in all sites in Year 3, representing about 95% of the total.	
Result C: The learning achievement of slow learners improves as the result of remedial interventions.	24. At least 50% of those designated as slow learners are promoted each academic year.	<u>Achieved for Years 1, 2, and 3</u> . Promotion rates among failing children reached 68% in Year 1, 87% in Year 2, and 66% in Year 3.
	25. Student repetition rates decline from a baseline in at least 60% of target schools by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . In Year 1, 50% reported declines in repetition. At the end of Year 2, this had increased to 71% and in Year 3 to 72% of schools.
Result D: Educational provision in schools is more relevant to student needs.	26. At least 50% of target schools provide more relevant education in the form of local life skill activities by the end of the program.	Partially Achieved . 38% of schools were providing local life skills at primary school level but 58% of secondary schools were doing so.
	27. 50% or more of schools achieve a score of satisfactory or better on a standardized instrument measuring educational relevance by the end of the program.	<u>Nearly Achieved</u> . In Year 1, 44% of schools reported achieving the standard; in Year 2, this increased to 52% but then declined slightly to 47% in Year 3 as the number of assisted schools increased.
	28. 75% of CFS experimental classrooms meet criteria defining child friendliness by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . All classrooms observed had achieved a minimum standard for physical environments.
TEACHER EDUCATION COMPONENT		
Result A: Classroom practice becomes more child-centered in comparison to a previously established baseline.	29. All community teachers remaining after integration of locally recruited PTTC graduates receive follow up support from technical program staff.	<u>Achieved</u> . Two workshops were provided in Year 3
	30. At least 90% of community teachers complete the full year of teaching.	<u>Nearly Achieved</u> . 89.4% of those originally recruited are still in the program, less those who have left in a planned phase-out.
	31. Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of Community Teachers meets an absolute standard for performance	<u>Achieved</u> . 77% of Community Teachers were found to be working at a minimum standard.

	each year.	
	32. Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of Multi-grade teachers becomes more child-centered in comparison to a baseline each year.	<u>Achieved</u> for Years 1 and 2. With a hand-over of this activity to the MoEYS/ADB, no further inputs for this indicator have been made in Year 3.
	33. At least 400 teachers in selected remote area schools receive technical support (for experimental CFS and CFSS classrooms) by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . 419 teachers (177 female) at both primary and secondary school level have received technical support through workshops and follow-up.
	34. Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of CFS Experimental Classroom Teachers becomes more child-centered by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . Although the reliability of the administration of the assessment tool used for this indicator needs to be reviewed, this indicator has reportedly been achieved at 93% compliance.
	35. At least 80% of SKL/BCA teachers achieve proficiency in the use of targeted techniques by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . Although absenteeism among SKL teachers has been a constraint in assessing this indicator, over 80% of those observed met a minimum standard for performance (particularly among BCAs).
Result B: Teacher education system at PTTC Level is more responsive to the needs of remote communities.	36. At least 150 locally recruited candidates have been admitted to PTTCs by the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . There are currently 209 PTTC students (104 female) who have received support from the program.
	37. At least 35% of locally recruited PTTC teacher candidates are from minority groups (Cham and hill tribe groups).	<u>Not Achieved</u> . In the event, only 11% of PTTC candidates recruited were from ethnic minorities.
SCHOOL COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP COMPONENT		
Result A: Communities demonstrate active participation in the instructional program of target schools.	38. At least 230 Community Teachers have been identified by local communities of whom 35% or more are comprised of minority groups by the end of the program.	<u>Not Achieved</u> . In Year 2, 25% of the 235 Community Teachers recruited by communities were from ethnic minority groups. Of the 144 Community Teachers remaining in Year 3, 24% were from minority groups.
	39. At least 150 locally recruited candidates from target areas have been admitted to PTTCs by December 2007.	<u>Achieved</u> .
	40. 90% of local reports indicate community participation in one or more of the following activity channels: LLSP, CT recruitment & mgt, teacher recruitment for PTTC entry, & school mapping. (Note: In areas where the activity is occurring.)	<u>Achieved</u> . Channel 1: 35% of schools Channel 2: 54% of schools Channel 3: 28% of schools Channel 4: 98% of schools
	41. 80% of Community Teacher Mgt Boards meet criteria for effectiveness each year.	<u>Achieved</u> . All boards surveyed met minimum performance requirements.
Result B: Schools are more sensitized to the diverse cultural needs of their students.	42. A majority of respondents in an attitudinal survey demonstrate satisfaction with educational provision according to an absolute standard.	<u>Achieved</u> . Trends in responding to an attitudinal survey showed majority satisfaction with a majority of hoped for expectations and largely better responding than in previous years.
PROGRAM MANAGEMENT COMPONENT		
Result A: Local education structures (e.g., clusters, lower secondary schools) and local government (e.g., communes) demonstrate ability to plan and implement interventions to improve access and quality.	43. All clusters, lower secondary schools, PTTCs, and CE-FACs provide improvement plans that meet criteria for funding and implement subsequently allocated grants according to prescribed criteria by the beginning of each academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> for all years. All clusters and secondary schools submitted annual plans that largely followed guidelines. (CEFACs received funds through clusters).
	44. All clusters, lower secondary schools, PTTCs & CEFACs submit requests for grants and properly liquidate those requests.	<u>Achieved</u> for all years. All clusters and secondary schools have regularly requested and liquidated grant funds though fund utilization rates have fallen behind schedule slightly in comparison to last year (due to disruptions caused by the national census)
Result B: Mechanisms are in place to collect data on program effectiveness.	45. All data collection tools developed in the first 2 years are reviewed and revised by the beginning of the 2006/7 academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> . Additional revisions completed.
	46. The Student Tracking System developed by US Dept of Labor has been adapted to fit the needs of ESCUP and is used by project staff & counterparts for student tracking.	<u>Achieved</u> . Additional revisions completed.
Result C: Lessons are documented and disseminated.	47. At least 5 school/ community representatives from each cluster/lower secondary school visit other sites for purposes of professional development during each academic year.	<u>Achieved</u> . <i>ESCUP I:</i> 111 individuals participated in such visits at primary level and 182 at secondary level (Primary Target: 90/Secondary Target: 70). <i>ESCUP II:</i> 128 individuals participated in such visits at primary level and 131 at secondary level (Primary Target: 110/Secondary Target: 95).
	48. A formal presentation is provided to Ministry and provinces describing the results and outcomes of the program at the end of the program.	<u>Achieved</u> . A Lessons Learned Seminar attended by high ranking MoEYS officials from all levels and stakeholders from provinces attended a one-day seminar in Phnom Penh on 17 June 2008.
	49. Representatives from DoE and PoEs visit each target cluster and high school during each program year.	<u>Achieved</u> .

Achievement levels for PMP indicators were impressive with 42 indicators falling into the category of *fully* or *nearly achieved*. This accounted for about 86% of all indicators. Another three indicators were

partly achieved while four were not achieved.

3.2.2 Program-wide Review of OP Indicators

Table 3.10 below describes the progress of ESCUP towards performance standards described in USAID's 2008 Operational Plan. A number of OP indicators did not have targets specified in Year 3 due to the nature of the interventions such as ICR construction, which only occurred in Year 2 of program implementation. Grade 5 and 6 promotion numbers were not specified in Year 3, as it was agreed that it would be difficult to meet expectations in this area with only three years of programming. Of the remaining nine indicators for which targets were specified, ESCUP achieved or nearly achieved eight or 89% with one performance indicator (life skills coverage) classified as only partly achieved.

In keeping with the increased focus on life skills programming, ESCUP II set a very high target for school coverage and doubled the hoped for performance standard from 25% of schools offering life skills courses in Year 2 to 50% coverage target at both primary and secondary school. According to compiled school reports, the number of schools providing life skills courses reached 59 schools at primary level in Year 3 compared to 44 schools in Year 2. Although this represents a fairly healthy increase from 27% to 35% coverage among primary schools year on year, it still falls short of the desired target by a margin of 15%. Nevertheless, program personnel have reported a great deal of enthusiasm among schools for IPM topics this year, particularly fish-ponds. For a one-time investment of as little as \$100, schools can raise as much as 20 kilograms of fish in a three month period, which they can then sell to replenish stocks. In the case of the 19 target secondary schools supported by the program, it was reported that 58% were able to provide life skills courses that ranged from basic computer literacy courses (for those with computer labs) to prevocational life skills such as cooking and sewing as well as agriculturally related topics such as fish and frog-raising.

Table 3.10: Summary of Progress against PMP Performance Indicators (Year 3)

Sub-element	Indicator	2008 Target	2008 Actual (As of Qtr 14)	Comments
Primary Ed	1. Number of learners enrolled in USG supported primary schools or equivalent non-school based settings	27,010 (M) 24,897 (F) 51,907 (T)	26,094 (M) 25,249 (F) 51,343 (T)	Nearly achieved
Lower Secondary Ed	2. Number of learners enrolled in USG supported secondary schools or equivalent non-school based settings	5,585 (M) 4,855 (F) 10,440 (T)	5,505 (M) 4,895 (F) 10,400 (T)	Achieved
Primary Ed	3. Learners completing fifth grade in USAID supported primary schools	No Target Specified	--	--
Primary Ed	4. Learners completing primary cycle (class 6) in USAID supported schools	No Target Specified	--	--
Education Systems	5. Number of teachers/educators trained with USG support	243 (M) 170 (F) 413 (T)	275 (M) 189 (F) 464 (T)	<u>Achieved</u>
	6. Number of parent-teacher associations or similar 'school' governance structures supported	166 Associations	166 Associations	<u>Achieved</u>
	7. Number of classrooms repaired with USG assistance	125 rooms	125 rooms	<u>Achieved</u> : This is in addition to 89 rooms repaired in FY2007
	8. Number of classrooms constructed with USG assistance	No Target Specified	1 additional ICR was constructed in Year 3 to complement 38 built in Year 2.	As no additional ICR construction was envisioned in Year 3, no target was specified for this indicator
	9. Schools implementing local life skills modules	83	70	<u>Partly Achieved</u>
	10. Schools reporting a decrease in student repetition.	65%	72% reported declines in Yr 3	<u>Achieved</u> for Years 2 and 3
	11. Schools reporting a decline in student drop-out rates.	65%	76% reported declines in Yr 3	<u>Achieved</u> for Years 2 and 3
	12. Students from disadvantaged populations enrolled in school	6,800	6,814 children	<u>Achieved</u>

3.2.3 Performance in the Access and Quality Component

Performance under this component was defined by 28 performance targets, the most of any component, ranging from decreasing repetition and dropout to improvements in educational relevance. Of these 28 targets, the program achieved or nearly achieved (within 2-3%) 23 indicators or 82%. The remaining five targets were either partially achieved (three targets), or not achieved (two targets). As noted above, some of the major achievements under this component related to major reductions in school dropout and repetition, major gains with respect to getting out-of-school children into school, and reductions in Pupil Teacher Ratios, although the latter of these was only partially achieved (68% of schools as opposed to a target of 75%, see indicator 16). Program strategies to improve access that involve the provision of scholarships to children at-risk (6,814 beneficiaries since start-up), increased penetration of the countryside through the use of Intermediate Classrooms, and adding extra grade levels to remote schools through the provision of Community Teachers all appear to be working.³ An important new area of activity that occurred under ESCUP II refers to the expansion of life skills, particularly IPM skills. This resulted in an increase in coverage from 27% of primary schools last year to 38% in the final year of programming, though this still falls short of an ambitious target of 50% coverage.

Significant progress was also reported at secondary school level where 76% of schools reported an increase in transition rate from baseline levels and several new innovative activities such as Subject Clubs were implemented. Health referrals have also helped to improve access and it is reported that 1,207 children with disabilities or chronic illnesses of a serious nature were treated by service providers as a result of program supported referral networks during the life of the program. The component also reported that reductions in PTR (from 67:1 to 50:1) have largely been sustained in the final year of programming. This improvement, due mainly to the introduction of Community Teachers, and more recently, locally recruited PTTC candidates, in remote communes, is assumed to be having a dramatic impact on educational quality by improving the amount of time that a teacher can spend with each student. Remedial teachers recruited by schools have this year been providing support to 3,955 children who failed 1st Semester Examinations of whom 66% actually passed, exceeding a target of 50%.

The two targets not achieved referred to targets for promoted students in Grades 5 (a target of 6,370 children) and Grade 6 (7,800 children) (see Indicators 22 and 23). Although these targets were not met, the number of those passing as a percentage of the total enrolment was nevertheless impressive at 94% for Grade 5 and 95% among those in Grade 6. The primary reason for the resulting shortfall was an overestimation of the total number of children enrolled in these two grades at a time when enrolments have been contracting due to demographic changes.

3.2.4 Performance in the Teacher Education Component

Program staff members in this component focused mainly on quality-related targets in a number of areas. This included training of Community Teachers, CFS Classroom Teachers (both primary and secondary school level), Supplementary Khmer Language (SKL) Teachers, and Bilingual Classroom Assistants (BCAs). In Year 3, earlier assistance for Multi-grade teachers was handed over to the MoEYS, which is using assistance from the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to upgrade support in this area. If one includes Community Teachers recruited by ESCUP as well as recently posted PTTC graduates, there is a total target population of 1,043 primary school teachers (396 female teachers) working in program-supported schools (inclusive of State, Community, and Contract Teachers). ESCUP has provided technical support to about 476 of these representing about 46% of all teachers. Among target secondary schools, there are 309 teachers (87 female teachers) of whom ESCUP has provided support to 98 or 32%. Performance under this component is defined by nine targets of which eight or 89% have been fully or nearly achieved. This includes classroom assessments of Community, CFS, and SKL teachers as well as Bilingual Classroom Assistants. Although assessments of CFS

³ It is believed that a major cause of student dropout in Cambodia relates to the decision of many children to leave school when they reach a terminal grade level at an incomplete school rather than transferring to the closest complete school, which may be many miles away.

teachers were happily very positive, the program feels that it may need to review the validity of survey administration protocols to verify whether classroom observation data can be believed. An important new activity under the component has been the preparation of Technical Support Groups, which are locally based resource persons whom the program hopes will eventually be able to provide technical support without the need for external assistance. The only target not achieved was a desire to ensure a minority quota of 35% among locally recruited teachers admitted to the PTTC. In the actual event, only 11% of those recruited were of minority extraction.

3.2.5 Performance in the School-Community Partnership Component

Activities under this component were organized on two levels to accommodate the two intermediate results developed. At one level, activities took in capacity building support for community structures such as Commune EFA Commissions (CEFAC) leading to enhanced ability to manage key community-driven interventions such as school mapping, Community Teacher recruitment, etc. In this respect the total number of assisted CEFACs was increased from four under ESCUP I to 11 under ESCUP II. An important theme running throughout support for community groups is advocacy for minorities in target areas. This refers in particular to increased representation of minorities among teachers and in school-community bodies. On another level, activities have been designed to increase the attraction of educational provision in the state school system so that they cater more to the individual needs of local communities. During Year 3, the component worked intensively with youth groups in Cham areas to mobilize young people as a force for change in target schools. The component also undertook a number of research studies regarding the Cham population in Kampong Cham in order to better understand the attitudes and concerns of this community.

Those working in the component achieved four out of five targets that define overall performance or 80% of the total. Major achievements included a favorable attitudinal survey that indicates improving community satisfaction with educational service provision in case study sites as well as greater community involvement in school activities. For example, about 93% of respondents in the attitudinal survey indicated they felt schools provided more relevant education than was true before. Similarly, schools reported greater community participation in a number of activity channels including school mapping activities (98% of schools have completed such activities), local life skills education (35% of schools are implementing at primary level), and recruitment of Community Teachers (54% of schools). Areas where the component did not fully achieve performance targets included advocacy goals for minority representation among Community Teachers (24% representation against a target of 35%). These shortfalls were mainly evident in Kampong Cham Province where the primary target group is Cham Muslims.

3.2.6 Performance in the Program Management Component

This component provides the organizational support that enables program technical activities to occur smoothly. Of the seven indicators defining this component's performance, all were fully or nearly achieved, including a highly successful Lessons Learned Seminar held in June 2008 that was well attended by government counterparts and colleagues from other donors. Important indicators that have been achieved include the completion of annual plans by clusters and secondary schools as well as the proper request and disbursement of grant funds.

During the last three years of program implementation, a total of \$421,652 was provided to cluster schools to program directly (e.g., remedial classes, scholarships, life skills, etc.) while another \$115,836 was provided under similar conditions to secondary schools. Total funds allocated to stakeholders for direct programming, therefore, amounted to \$537,488.⁴ With technical capacity from program personnel, primary schools succeeded in expending 84% of their approved budgets while secondary schools achieved a 76% fund utilization rate of its approved budgets (see Table 3.11). Fund utilization rates evinced an upward trend with each passing year, suggesting gains resulting from capacity building and experience. These observations demonstrate that implementing activities that im-

⁴ These funds do not include support for Community Teachers, Lower Secondary School Scholarships, PTTC Scholarships, or Infrastructure Repairs.

pact on school efficiency is not a simple matter of allocating funds to schools, but rather of effective utilization and stakeholder capacity. If schools had been allowed to use USAID-provided funds to simply build flagpoles and gardens (as many would have liked), a 100% fund utilization rate could easily have been achieved each year. ESCUP programmers, however, established conditions for using funds that focused on enhancing services for communities and children rather than taking the easy way out and pouring these funds into construction. Administering such services is clearly a complex undertaking, which took time for stakeholders to acquire the capacity to do so.

Table 3.11: Summary of School Grant Provisions and Overall Fund Utilization Rates, 2005-08

Year	Primary Level			Secondary School Level		
	Approved Budget	Amount Spent	%	Approved Budget	Amount Spent	%
2005/6	\$156,870	\$124,930	80%	\$27,112	\$13,313	49%
2006/7	\$139,574	\$113,841	82%	\$37,820	\$31,757	84%
2007/8	\$125,208	\$117,156	94%	\$50,904	\$43,422	85%
Total	\$421,652	\$355,927	84%	\$115,836	\$88,492	76%

Although the improvement plans submitted by schools were far from perfect, they nevertheless demonstrated reflection on local needs and were in many cases quite different from place to place. In this respect, clusters had identified 40 discrete activities to implement during the year. Across the 22 clusters and 14 secondary schools supported by ESCUP in Year 3, this translated into the implementation of 445 discrete incidences of activities at primary level and 381 such incidences at secondary level.

3.3 Overview of Program Activities Employed to Achieve Intermediate Results

One of the things promised, as part of the extension submission to USAID for ESCUP II was to conduct a student census that counted beneficiaries receiving key interventions in a way, which eliminated double counting (i.e., when one child received more than one intervention). This census took place at the end of the 2007/8 academic year and surveyed 15 major interventions implemented through support from ESCUP.⁵ The survey found that 28,320 children were receiving one or more direct interventions from the program out of the 51,343 primary school children enrolled or about 55% of the total (see Table 3.12). This does not include children who also benefited from the provision of toilets, wells, libraries, and other interventions where benefits are more difficult to quantify (since an entire school can benefit from them). If these children were included, the total number of beneficiaries would be even higher. Rather, these 55% comprise the most vulnerable children who received health care support, subsidies to cover the direct costs of education (e.g., scholarships), children with special learning needs (e.g., remedial support), children with no access to education (e.g., Intermediate Classrooms), and others.

Table 3.12: Student Beneficiaries at Primary Level, Year 3

Intervention	Number of Beneficiaries	
1. Primary Scholarships	5,619	
2. Village-based Remediation	2,556	
3. Home-based Remediation	57	
4. Community-based Life Skills	1,911	
5. Cultural Life Skills	724	
6. Agrarian Life Skills (IPM)	1,260	
7. CFS Classroom Environments	13,749	
8. Health Referrals	388	
9. Bilingual Classroom Assistants	1,036	
10. Supplementary Khmer Language (SKL)	190	
11. Peer Tutoring (Child to Child)	4,788	
12. Homework Clubs (Child to Child)	3,246	
13. Intermediate Classroom Provision (ICR)	2,970	
14. Community Teacher Provision	5,212	
15. Student Associations	482	
Children Receiving at Least 1 Intervention	17,810	63%
Children Receiving at Least 2 Interventions	6,967	25%
Children Receiving at Least 3 Interventions	2,364	8%
Children Receiving at Least 4 Interventions	1,179	4%
Total Children Receiving Direct Interventions	28,320	100%

⁵ These 15 interventions do not include the School Breakfast Program (supported by World Food Program in ESCUP sites) either because it is believed that its ubiquity in Kampong Cham would skew the results of the census. Over 37,000 children benefit from SBP alone.

The program also sought to employ a strategy in ensuring that the most vulnerable children received multiple interventions, as it is believed that this maximizes the likelihood that they will stay in school or be promoted. In this respect, it was reported that 25% of the beneficiaries registered by the census had received two interventions, while 8% had received three interventions, and another 4% had received four interventions. Thus, 37% of those identified in the census had received at least two interventions or more, thereby suggesting that the program was successful in a strategy of providing multiple interventions. It is further believed that this strategy is at least in part responsible for the large reductions in dropout and repetition, reported in PMP indicators #8 and #25.

4. KEY ELEMENTS OF SUCCESS AND THE CONSTRAINTS ENCOUNTERED

4.1 Key Program Achievements

This section highlights key successes and the important strategies underlying them that were achieved by the program. These successes included (i) the identification of interventions with high success rates through a hybrid program model; (ii) maximizing the impact of interventions by addressing a key pre-condition for them to work – the availability of teachers; (iii) combining interventions in a way that combats one of the key causes of dropout, i.e., improvements in incomplete schools; and (iv) extending educational access to un-served communities through quick and effective outreach.

4.1.1 Developing a Hybrid Program Model

In designing the ESCUP Program, agency personnel in World Education and KAPE were careful to review the lessons learned from other programs. This resulted in the adoption of a number of tried and tested interventions that ensured a high success rate for many activities when implemented. Such interventions included scholarship and remedial interventions piloted under KAPE-UNICEF, life skills programming developed by World Education, and the use of Community Teachers and bilingual education interventions developed by CARE, among others. By taking the best of many earlier programs, ESCUP benefited from the additive effects of many strong interventions used in unique combinations. That is, these interventions were used in multiple combinations based on the needs identified in the local context through stakeholder driven programming. This ensured that interventions met local needs and introduced a high level of efficiency in the implementation of activities. The use of a hybridized intervention model in this way contrasts with many program designs in which a ‘one-size fits all’ approach is usually used, which is usually highly inefficient and wasteful.

4.1.2 Addressing Teacher Shortages

ESCUP has been one of the few education development programs in Cambodia to identify teacher shortages as a problem of the highest priority and to take decisive action to solve them in a sustainable manner. Teacher shortages are one of the primary limitations that impede access and quality goals identified by the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport (MoEYS). These shortages not only lead to classroom overcrowding with accompanying effects on quality but also to reduced educational provision in incomplete schools and areas without any schools whatsoever. Historically, teacher shortages in Cambodia have been getting worse rather than better as policy changes governing admission to Provincial Teacher Training Colleges (PTTC) have raised admission standards to completion of Grade 12. As most rural areas lack secondary school facilities, these changes have greatly restricted the recruitment of potential candidates to urban dwellers who often have little desire to work in remote, rural areas. In combination with mandatory retirement of teachers in remote areas who were recruited during the 1980s when qualifications were much lower, official policies have denuded the teaching force in remote areas at the same time that they have made local recruitment in these areas much more restrictive.

MoEYS will soon require major assistance from its development partners to address major teacher shortages in the basic education sector. These shortages will begin to intensify as demographic trends indicate that age-specific population declines among school-aged children that began in 2004 will begin to reverse in 2009. It is quite fortunate that these demographic trends have helped to avert a major crisis during the middle years of the present decade. Time, however, is running out. Currently, there are only about 50,000 primary school teachers to staff 61,000 classes (cf. EMIS, 2006). This has required widespread use of double shift teaching, which places incredible strains on an already under resourced teaching force and impacts negatively on educational quality. One must honestly ask whether any human being can effectively teach 8 hours a day, 6 days a week? Output from PTTCs is just barely keeping up with retirements and resignations. With support from ESCUP, MoEYS has moved forward with dynamic experimentation to address teacher shortages such as flexible entry requirements to PTTCs (e.g., 9+2), use of Community Teachers in state schools, and affirmative action in minority communities. MoEYS will soon require expanded support from its development partners to bring these efforts forward as enrolments once again begin to expand. The teacher shortage prob-

lem is perhaps the single biggest threat to Cambodia's effort to achieve EFA and deserves its designation as 'the invisible crisis.'

ESCUP has sought to address the problem of teacher shortages in two ways. As an immediate response, the program has assisted local leaders to recruit Community Teachers who can staff incomplete primary schools and one-room schools in remote areas. Since program start-up, over 235 Community Teachers have been fielded to local state schools. In order to ensure a long lasting solution to chronic shortages in target areas, ESCUP has also worked with the Teacher Training Department and local groups to undertake local recruitment drives for PTTC admission. Candidates passing the PTTC entrance exam receive scholarship support from the program for two years (the length of the official training period) and are exempted from usual posting requirements that do not consider the desirability of sending new teacher recruits to their place of origin. After two years, these candidates return to target areas as state teachers. Over the course of its programming, ESCUP has supported 209 PTTC scholarship students as well as over 235 Community Teachers who are providing instruction to over 10,000 children who otherwise would not have had access to a teacher.

4.1.3 Adding Grade Levels to Target Schools and Extending Educational Access

One of the key causes of dropout in Cambodia relates to the problem of incomplete schools and the shortage of teachers. It is estimated that of the 6,277 state primary schools in Cambodia, only about 4,558 or 73% have a complete complement of Grades 1 to 6. The remaining 27% only offer five levels of education and many only one or two levels (i.e., Grades 1 and 2). The vast majority of these schools are located in remote and underserved areas. When a child at one of these schools completes the highest grade level taught, he or she is faced with the choice of continuing their education by walking several kilometers to the nearest complete school or dropping out. Often, the choice made is to drop out, particularly in the case of very young children who are too small to walk a long distance to a complete school. In other areas, there are often no schools at all, not even an incomplete one. ESCUP has tried to address this key problem underlying dropout through a combination of Community Teachers, local teacher recruitment, and/or the construction of intermediate classrooms (ICRs). In the case of an incomplete school, the availability of a locally recruited Community Teacher or a PTTC graduate allows the school to add another grade level to the school. This has the effect of delaying the decision of a child to dropout by providing educational access to the next grade without having to walk to a distant complete school. Indeed, it has been reported that 47 (or 78%) of the 60 incomplete schools in ESCUP sites have added a grade since program start-up. By keeping a child in school for as long as possible in this way, he or she will eventually be old enough to walk to a complete school when the time comes. If the incomplete school does not have enough classrooms to accommodate an extra grade level, the program can also provide a small grant to the local community to build an ICR. It is believed that this combination of interventions, in addition to scholarships and some other interventions underlie the dramatic reduction in dropout out reported in target schools. In this respect, the overall dropout rate has declined from 9.3% at baseline to 5.3% at the end of the program. This represents a drop of about 43% in dropout levels.

4.1.4 Extending Educational Access to Un-Served Communities

ESCUP has been highly successful in providing educational access to completely un-served communities quickly and effectively. The primary means the program has used to achieve this refers to support for temporary buildings made of local materials (mainly thatch and bamboo covering a wooden frame). Nearly 38 classrooms have been provided in this way since start-up. This intervention, taken from the recently published MoEYS Child Friendly School Activity Menu, provides an immediate, albeit temporary solution to the problem of school availability. These one-room, intermediate classroom structures are generally staffed by a Community Teacher and enable educational service provision within a very short period of time. This approach is vastly superior to cumbersome school construction projects, which usually take years to complete from the time of program start-up through environmental impact assessments, actual construction, and eventual registration with government, excluding the additional time required to staff such structures with state teachers. In combination with the provision of Community Teachers and community mobilization activities, ESCUP has found that support for ICRs can reach a large number of children in a very short period of time (usually within

short period of time (usually within six to eight weeks). After their establishment, ICRs generate a local culture of school attendance and eventually put these areas on the radar screen for more formalized school construction by Government or an international development bank. The ESCUP program, therefore, has played a crucial role in jump-starting an important process leading to expanded educational provision in remote areas.⁶

4.2 Constraints in Program Implementation

In spite of the successes recounted above, there have also been serious constraints that have pushed back against successful strategies and interventions. These are summarized below.

4.2.1 Impacts of the Census and National Elections on School Functioning

The final year of program implementation saw major operational constraints arise that had not been foreseen. It has been a usual practice in Cambodia to use rural teachers and school directors as election workers and enumerators for the National Census and elections. Although it certainly makes more sense to hire individuals such as jobless university graduates (who have become more numerous in recent years) for these needs, there is often a desire to look for ways to supplement teacher incomes by employing them for such activities. On paper, the teachers who leave their posts in order to work in the census or on local election committees are covered by ‘substitutes.’ In actual practice, however, the overstretched teaching force that is already struggling with fielding 50,000 teachers to cover 61,000 classes (mainly through double shift teaching) is in no position to identify substitute teachers, especially in rural areas where Pupil Teacher Ratios are already 60 and 70 to one. Thus, what actually happens during a census or an election is that classes are suspended for the duration. The decision to use teachers for these events really is a decision to make children pay the price for supplementing teacher salaries, since they receive no educational service provision during these periods.

The 2007/8 academic year was hit by a double ‘whammy’ because there was not only a national election this year but also a census. Each event pulled teachers and directors out of their positions for six to eight weeks. Thus, the elections and census resulted in school closures of up to three months in Year 3, in addition to the usual practices of early closure and late re-opening after the many national holidays sprinkled through the year. Some provinces were particularly hard hit such as Mondulkiri, where the schools were in virtual free fall since mid-February when census preparations began in earnest. Many schools in the province were closed for February and March plus April (for the traditional Khmer New Year Holiday) plus June and July for the elections. Field personnel in Mondulkiri reported that between 60 to 70% of teachers in target schools left their posts for the census. Things were somewhat better in Kratie and Kampong Cham where teachers are more numerous, but there were still disruptions. This situation partly explains the decline in fund utilization rates reported by field offices in relation to school grants.

4.2.2 Governance Issues and their Role in Program Implementation

One of the important programmatic themes under ESCUP II was the effort to bring governance issues and probity in the use of program funds into sharper focus at all levels. This process began at the end of the 2006/7 academic year with a performance review of all schools based on a standardized assessment form that looked at different measures of governance (e.g., probity in the use of funds, school efficiency indicators, community participation, etc.). Field personnel, in collaboration with district and provincial office of education counterparts, went through the form for each school and assigned specific scores for each criterion listed. Schools scoring below a certain level, and in particular those that had mismanaged funds, were placed on a red list, meaning that they were in danger of expulsion from the program unless changes in performance or personnel or both were forthcoming. Schools where mismanagement of funds had occurred were reported to POE Directors in a letter informing them that the program no longer had confidence in the management there and support could

⁶ One ICR generally requires approximately \$500 in investment for materials with labor provided by communities.

not continue without a change in personnel. In cases where the problem was more one of incompetence, conditions for improved performance were announced as a pre-requisite for continued involvement in the program. Provinces have been highly variable in their responses to these problems.

For its own part, ESCUP II increased the amount of monitoring it does to ensure proper use of program funds. This included more spot checks of grant utilization to determine that schools have indeed used funds for their intended purpose. Spot checks looked at both the purchase of materials as well as the implementation of activities and any regular payments of community teachers, remedial teachers (for work performed outside of regular working hours), etc. that these might require. The program found some abuses and these were reported to the POE for action. In all cases, funds have been returned. Program personnel also undertook a major survey of scholarship recipients and community members to assess probity in the administration of this activity, which is one of the program's most resource-intensive. In general, results of surveys were mostly positive though there have been issues concerning the unauthorized substitution of students to receive scholarship support in cases when a beneficiary drops out. This is allowed under activity rules, but schools must inform the program first.

The Provincial Office of Education in Kampong Cham showed the greatest responsiveness to problems brought to its attention by the program and has actually removed a school director who had sold School Breakfast Program rice to buy a motorcycle for his family. The POE Director in the province is new but is also a high-ranking member of the party hierarchy in the province and has few fears about anyone questioning his political credentials. He has, therefore, been highly decisive in responding to problems. The POE Director in Mondulhiri agreed to visit problem schools in his province in person (the problem in Mondulhiri is more one of incompetence than corruption) to deliver warnings to several school directors. They were told to improve their performance or they would face transfer to highly undesirable locations. This actually happened in one case but in most schools, directors know that the POE cannot easily move staff around the province due to severe personnel shortages there. They, therefore, know that they have a strong card to play against the POE. In general, incompetent and unprofessional behavior continues to be largely tolerated in the state schools in Mondulhiri due to these personnel shortages.

The POE in Kratie has been the most ineffectual in its response to problems, even where these concerned financial misuse of program funds. Although the POE was quite honest in acknowledging the problem in these schools and even reported that they had stolen a great deal of PAP funds from the government in the past, it was difficult to take action against them. The school directors in question are members of the party's commune-level machinery and can, therefore, not easily be removed, especially since the POE Director is not well placed politically. The program was, therefore, forced to expel two schools with corrupt school directors from the program in Kratie since the POE would not or could not remove the directors found to be embezzling funds (though they have since repaid them to the program). The decision of ESCUP to push these schools out of the program was done in a way so that communities were aware of the reason. Unfortunately, transparency in this case has not been a powerful enough tool to effect the needed changes in the local schools.

The experiences recounted above demonstrate the high tolerance level for corrupt and incompetent behavior in the state schools. To be sure, tolerance levels are variable from place to place. School management is not generally accountable to local communities, even in cases where egregious behavior is known to all. The POE takes or does not take action based on important political considerations or on situational factors (such as the personnel shortages in Mondulhiri) so that undesirable behaviors are not viewed in a vacuum but rather in a highly politicized context that leads to a culture of tolerance for corrupt behavior. Although the program has tried to push POEs to lower its tolerance for such behavior, its success has been highly variable.

4.2.3 Price Inflation and Impacts on Grant Activities

Increases in the cost of fuel and other goods have been proceeding at a brisk pace since the start of ESCUP, but these trends really accelerated during the last six months of program implementation in 2008. Happily, most program expenditures for infrastructure improvements had been completed at the

beginning of the school year because it is in the area of construction materials that Cambodia is seeing the worst price inflation of all. For example, straggler schools that were still repairing toilets or digging wells in March 2008 reported that standard unit costs for these activities had nearly doubled since October 2008. Thus, a toilet block that used to cost \$150-\$200 a year ago now costs between \$300 and \$400. Similarly, travel, lodging, and food costs for workshops all increased by a wide margin in Year 3, requiring the program to rein in capacity building activities, as well. In addition, the World Food Program announced the suspension of its School Breakfast Program in March 2008 due to the spiraling cost of rice. The School Breakfast Program was active in most ESCUP-supported schools in Kampong Cham and, therefore, affected about 90+ schools or about 34,000 children. These and other changes in costs greatly changed the whole complexion of what a project can accomplish with a given amount of funding and greatly impacted program benchmarks that had not anticipated that costs would spiral quite this much out of control.

4.2.4 Obstacles to Achieving Impacts on Classroom Practice

Monitoring visits to CFS classrooms during the last year of implementation once again highlighted the need to avoid grand schemes for change in the short-term. While it is true that there are a number of teachers who really seem to understand the substance of the changes sought by the program, these are by far a very small minority. Monitoring reports have indicated that physical changes in classrooms have been achieved to a large extent, but that many teachers do not prepare lesson plans nor do they understand well the objective of the lessons that they are teaching. What observers have noted is that teachers seem to have acquired some mastery of the form of teaching (games, group work, etc) but do not seem to understand why they are using these techniques in their teaching. That is, they have the 'form' but not the real 'substance' of the target methodologies presented in teacher education workshops. These observations explode the often naïve belief that one-off teacher training workshops can have major impacts on teacher practice. In truth, many teachers lack the educational pre-requisites or previous experience needed to grasp many of the concepts presented at workshops. Based on this experience, ESCUP programmers stepped back to re-examine the content of its workshop programming, much of which was borrowed from KAPE to use with more advanced school clusters. The program, therefore, realized that many of the concepts presented (such as student portfolios, learning corners, etc) were perhaps too ambitious for teachers in remote schools and that these should be removed from future training programs in favor of more basic methods and techniques (e.g., identifying educational objectives as part of lesson planning).

4.2.5 Long-term Time Frame Required for Change in Schools

Although there are a number of schools that moved forward rapidly during the final year of program implementation in terms of the overall improvements observed in their learning environments, it is important to reflect that these schools did not do well during the first year of program implementation. The bottom-up implementation strategy employed by ESCUP in which stakeholders define their own needs and develop individualized programming based on a review of these needs clearly was not initially well understood. Upon closer inspection, it is probably not surprising that after many decades of being conditioned to do as ordered rather than thinking proactively, many stakeholders found it very difficult to adjust to the new development regime promoted by ESCUP. It took more than a year in many cases before schools and communities were able to take advantage of a development approach driven by stakeholders rather than a centrally administered project structure that is so characteristic of many development programs. By Year 3 of program implementation, many stakeholders appeared to have adjusted their thinking and behavioral styles accordingly and made rapid progress in solving local problems with a strong sense of ownership of the process. Once again, this demonstrates the primacy of local attitudes as a key factor that affects the implementation of development projects and argues for a long-term timeframe for such projects rather than one-off dabbling in material and technical support that is generally the norm.

4.2.6 Posting of First Batch of PTTC Graduates to Communes of Origin

Discussions to replace Community Teachers with newly graduated PTTC students have been a protracted process in Kratie and Mondulkiri. Kampong Cham has been the most cooperative province in this regard with complete support from the provincial personnel office to move forward with posting

of ESCUP-supported graduates to their communes of origin. The personnel office in Kratie was at first reluctant to comply with expectations to send PTTC scholarship recipients back to their communes of origin but finally agreed, leading to a smooth process of posting to remote areas. The mediation of the Teacher Training Department was crucial in this regard and highly effective. Unfortunately, negotiations with the provincial personnel office in Mondulkiri were much more problematic. The reasons cited by the POE for its reluctance to post teachers to their communes of origin relate to severe teacher shortages in other districts.

With the completion of the 2007/8 school year in July 2007, 169 scholarship recipients earlier enrolled in Provincial Teacher Training Colleges with ESCUP support had finally been posted to rural schools. ESCUP was quite anxious that these students be sent to the areas from which they were recruited as originally agreed with Provincial Offices of Education. Although personnel issues are a highly sensitive (and secretive) area within the education system where the interference of outsiders is not usually countenanced, ESCUP was proactive in ensuring that program supported scholarship recipients were exempted from a score-based system for teacher postings (i.e., the primary criteria for posting should be place of origin).⁷ In this respect, Provincial Coordinators prepared tentative lists of schools where Community Teachers were being used to meet shortages that are also schools, where PTTC candidates had been recruited. As noted above, Kampong Cham was the most receptive province to program solicitations to post students to their commune (though not necessarily village) of origin, whereas Mondulkiri was the least receptive.

4.2.7 Attrition of CFS Classroom Teachers

Program planners were very concerned about the attrition of CFS teachers in the program. During Year 3, 46 CFS teachers trained in earlier years left the program. This represents about 29% of all the teachers trained in 2006/7 (160 in all), at considerable expense to the program. More than a third of those leaving (16 persons) did so in order to move to secondary schools where shortages continue to be severe, particularly as the Ministry expands secondary education provision. Another 14 (or 30%) transferred to other schools while the rest left for a combination of reasons including resignations, retirements, health, or RTTC entry. While it is certain that those teachers moving to other institutions will be able to use what they have learned from the program in their new posts, these statistics demonstrate the chaotic movement of personnel within the education system. It also underlines the difficulty of programs such as ESCUP to work with a stable pool of teachers over a multi-year period to develop their capacity.

4.2.8 Selection of CFS Experimental Classroom Teachers during Year 3

In order to comply with Ministry expectations that all teachers in selected schools are in compliance with CFS policy, ESCUP revised its approach to teacher training in which teachers are allowed to volunteer for participation in workshops. The voluntary approach to teacher education had been introduced before Child Friendly School development approaches were adopted by the Ministry as an official policy. Although ESCUP did not have enough resources to train all 1,000+ teachers in target schools, it did try to comply with Ministry policy by designating certain schools as model schools and training all teachers within such selected schools. This methodology is known as the 'whole school' approach. The selection of model schools was done in collaboration with Provincial Offices of Education and was based on assessments of high performance during the last two years, cooperation levels between teachers and schools directors, and general motivation levels among school managers and teachers. POEs endorsed this change in approach and were highly cooperative in the designation of model schools. During ESCUP II, the program selected three model schools in Mondulkiri, seven in Kratie, and six in Kampong Cham totaling 16 schools.

⁷ Under normal practice, PTTC graduates are allowed to choose the school to which they would like to be posted based on their final academic scores. Those with the highest scores are allowed to choose from the available posts available first while those with the lowest scores must go to the posts that are left over, usually the least desirable locations.

4.3 Important Lessons Learned

There are several key lessons learned under the ESCUP Program that will prove to be very useful for future programming.

4.3.1 Diversifying Interventions according to School Capacity and Links with Governance Issues

Selective implementation and the use of school governance criteria in development has been an important lesson learned under the current USAID-AIR-World Education partnership. Different localities are not the same in their receptivity to development initiatives or their ability to utilize funds with professional integrity. Professionalism and good management practices among school directors and teachers are often lacking, which invite serious risks for development investment. In this regard, current programming has not adequately distinguished between schools with strong management capacity, those with medium levels of management capacity, and those that are dysfunctional due to the low integrity of the individuals that manage them. Schools in the latter category should be passed over for assistance unless the local education authority can make changes in personnel to reduce the risks involved with assistance. Schools in the other two categories should receive modulated forms of assistance that are commensurate with their management capacity.

4.3.2 The Need for a Flexible Project Design

A **flexible project design** allows local stakeholders to develop their own programming content based on their own perceived needs. Under the current USAID-funded Program, local stakeholders received extensive technical support for needs analysis and objective-based planning that enabled them to determine what they needed to change in their schools/communities and how they might effect these changes. When development is stakeholder driven in this way, it ensures local ownership and engagement in programming, which in turn increases the likelihood for sustainability once Program support is phased out. This simple logic is usually lost in most other projects in the education sector in Cambodia where “one size fits all” approaches imposed from above tend to be the norm.

4.3.3 Using Stakeholder-driven Program Models

The use of **open-ended grants and activity menus** has gone hand-in-hand with stakeholder-driven development themes described earlier. The open-ended nature of the grants provided by the program empowers stakeholders and allows them to drive the development process. To be sure, programming grant funds is a negotiated process so that issues relating to government policy and donor interests can also be interjected into planning activities, mainly through awareness raising that is an integral part of capacity building activities. The use of Activity Menus, which cross-reference possible interventions to common problems, greatly helps to ensure that there is some structure in the planning process that echoes national policy themes such as children’s rights, improved educational efficiency (e.g., reducing dropout), and the needs of underserved groups including minorities, girls and the physically challenged. Activity menus also address certain challenges in promoting stakeholder-driven development that arise from the limited exposure of local stakeholders to different ways of doing things and years of conditioning that discourages proactive management processes. Indeed, it should be noted that this conditioning, which underlies many of the dysfunctional behavior patterns at local level is not easily reversed. Often it requires two or more years of intensive capacity building for self-determination practices to firmly take root.

Implementation of ESCUP has relied on **intensive involvement of counterparts and local partners** (including local NGOs) through a working group structure that is inter-sectoral in nature. This structure, known as the **Provincial Working Group (PWG)**, builds on earlier precedents established under the work carried out by KAPE and UNICEF and utilizes existing institutional frameworks that are sanctioned by government. These include representatives from school clusters, secondary school directors, district offices of education, and representatives from the major offices in the Provincial Office of Education (e.g., Primary Education Office, Inspectorate, etc.). The Working Group is headed jointly by the POE Director or Vice Director as well as a Provincial Coordinator employed by the program. PWGs receive capacity building in planning, problem analysis, using Activity Menus, budgeting, requesting and disbursing school grants, and monitoring/reporting.

5. SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES

The ESCUP program is confident that its wide-ranging capacity building framework and heavy reliance on existing local committees for the implementation of interventions will ensure both technical and institutional sustainability of interventions. This includes support provided to Local Cluster School Committees (LCSC), Technical Support Groups (TSG), which provide on-going peer support to teachers, and Commune-level EFA Commissions (CEFAC). Each of these institutional bodies are permanent committees existing prior to the implementation of the program. Thus, ESCUP actively sought to strengthen existing institutional bodies that will continue to exist after the closure of the program, rather than creating special institutional structures with little or no longevity after the cessation of program support.

ESCUP also tried to maximize the impact of key strategies by supporting special seminars at national level to actively disseminate the lessons learned and important programmatic approaches in improving educational access and quality. The preparation for such seminars involved considerable documentation of program training activities in the form of modules and facilitator implementation manuals. One such seminar that was very well received by Ministry was the Lessons Learned Seminar, which took place in June 2008. The Lessons Learned Seminar was attended by over 100 participants from among other donor agencies, NGOs, key Ministry departments, and stakeholders from target provinces. This seminar also organized a demonstration of the program's *Activity Menu Toolkit*, which provides extensive documentation of all activities in an easy to access framework in which interventions are cross-referenced to common problems encountered by education development practitioners. Indeed, this toolkit is currently being widely disseminated to programs in other countries through the EQUIP1 website.

As is often the case with development programs, resource sustainability is more problematic. For key interventions such as the provision of Community Teachers, ESCUP is extremely confident that its pairing up of this intervention with local recruitment of PTTC candidates will ensure that much of the impact on lowered PTR levels will be sustained. Indeed, the program's coordinated efforts with Government to recruit teachers locally, successfully advocate for the introduction 9+2 PTTC induction,⁸ and use Community Teachers in state schools will likely be the centerpiece of ESCUP's efforts to achieve sustainable development in the sector. In this respect, the program successfully reduced teacher shortages in over 200 instances, resulting in improved educational services to over 10,000 children. To be sure, additional advocacy efforts to at least give remaining Community Teachers not covered by the posting of PTTC graduates the right to take a certifying examination are clearly needed. It is hoped that this task will be made somewhat easier by the strong support received from Provincial Offices of Education (an important ally in the struggle to solve teacher shortages) as well as H.E. Nath Bunroeun for this set of interventions as well as increasing concern in Government about the teacher shortage issue.

But there are other instances of resource sustainability as well. In this respect, several interventions that rely heavily on school grants from ESCUP may be partially shifted to Program-based Budgeting support (PB)(i.e., school operating budgets). These include support for libraries, life skills materials, and CFS classroom materials. Yet, it is also certain that the many restrictions that apply to PB funding will create difficulties for some activities, particularly those that involve non-material costs. For example, PB funding is mainly limited to expenses for materials and cannot be used for personnel costs,

⁸ The previous teacher recruitment regime of the MoEYS required a Grade 12 education level for admission to a PTTC followed by two years of teacher training (i.e., 12+2). However, a new policy, facilitated by combined POE and ESCUP advocacy efforts, to alleviate teacher shortages has allowed entrance to the PTTCs at Grade 9 for a limited period of 3 years, giving a unique window of opportunity for local recruitment in areas with severe teacher shortages. Few people have Grade 12 education levels in target areas with severe teacher shortages, which is the primary justification for the new policy. Originally, this policy was only allowed in the remote northeastern provinces of Cambodia, but was recently extended to mainstream provinces such as Kampong Cham in late 2007.

travel, or other forms of support that are often critical to many of the activities supported by ESCUP. The reversion to increased reliance on voluntary labor in a post-project environment will ensure at best only limited and *ad hoc* implementation of formerly program-supported activities such as life skills.

ESCUP nevertheless continues to be hopeful that a significant proportion of the costs for large-scale program-supported activities can be shifted to Government programming. For example, MoEYS has expressed interest in developing a special PB category for scholarship support at primary school level. Indeed, scholarship activities similar to those developed by ESCUP will be implemented on a pilot basis in three provinces of Northeast under Fast Track Initiative (FTI) funding. These provinces include Ratanakiri, Stung Treng, and Mondulakiri, an ESCUP target province. The manual on scholarship implementation developed under ESCUP funding has been an opportunity for purposeful dialogue with the Ministry in this regard and multiple copies of the ESCUP manual have been sent to the World Bank and Directorate of General Education.

For smaller scale interventions with personnel costs such as support for BCAs and Life Skills teachers, ESCUP is working with Local NGO (LNGO) partners to utilize local fund raising as a means to ensure the continuation of key activities on some scale after program closure. Consultations with KAPE have in particular been very productive in this regard. Based on these discussions, KAPE is now in the process of restructuring its Board of Advisers in a way that will facilitate the establishment of a small Endowment Fund, which may be accessed by Commune EFA Commissions for funding support for selected activities. Grants made under this mechanism will likely be small (e.g., \$300 to \$400 per cluster) but nevertheless adequate to sustain selected interventions such BCAs (annual cost per person: \$150), life skills teachers (annual cost per person: \$30), or remedial teachers (annual cost per person: \$67).

ESCUP hopes that the mix of measures described above will be enough to ensure that a large part of its programming can be sustained into the future, particularly in areas where LNGO partners are geographically anchored. Indeed, the selection of such partners as opposed to free-floating LNGOs that have no grounding in target areas was part of a long-term framework developed by the program during the design period.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 General Overview

By any measure, ESCUP has been a reasonably successful program though certain situational factors such as the national census and elections have been major constraints during the final year of implementation. A review of the indicators described in this report indicates that 42 indicators have been fully achieved or nearly so, within a margin of two or three percentage points. This comprises about 86% of

Table 6.1: Summary of PMP Indicator Status

Indicator Status	Number of Indicators	As a %
Achieved or Nearly Achieved (within 2-3%)*	42	86%
Partially Achieved	3	6%
Not Achieved	4	8%
Pending or Cancelled	0	0%
Total	49	100%

*There were six indicators in the category of 'Nearly Achieved.'

the indicators stated in the PMP (see Table 6.1). As was true of ESCUP I, the successful achievement of performance standards has been most evident in the area of promoting access and increasing educational efficiency (i.e., reducing dropout and repetition). For example, 72% of schools reported reducing repetition rates and 76% reported reducing dropout in comparison to baseline levels in Year 3. These are truly amazing impacts. Outreach to minority communities, strategies to reduce PTR levels and ease teacher shortages, scholarship support, health outreach to the physically challenged, Intermediate Classrooms, and life skills provisions have all played a major role in this success. Another 8% of indicators have been partially achieved.

There were only four indicators that were not achieved outright or about 8% of the total. These indicators mostly dealt with ambitious minority quotas and a higher performance standard for expanded provision of life skills courses. With respect to the former, the program had set an ambitious target of ensuring that 35% of Community Teachers and PTTC recruits with scholarship support were of minority extraction. In the actual event, only about 24% of Community Teachers were from minority groups while 11% of PTTC students were. Although these outcomes fall short of the hoped for affirmative action quota intended, they do still represent a considerable improvement from a pre-program situation when there was only 1 or 2% minority representation among state teachers even in areas where there were high concentrations of minority groups or 0% representation at the local PTTC in Kampong Cham. Two other indicators that were not achieved related to promotion levels among Grade 5 and 6 children. Although 72% of schools reported an improvement in their overall rates of student promotion across all grades, the numerical targets set for promotion in Grades 5 and 6 proved to be too ambitious.

In terms of life skills provision indicators that were only partially achieved, ESCUP sought to double its performance standard from 25% coverage under ESCUP I to at least 50% under the last phase of programming. In the actual event, coverage did improve significantly from 27% of schools last year to 38% this year (or a 41% expansion from 2006/7), but still short of the hoped for goal. Nevertheless, the high quality of life skills programming, particularly the work done in Integrated Pest Management (IPM) and agricultural life skills has been a significant achievement as numerous success stories in the quarterly and annual reports attest.

Another area of major progress refers to expanded support to Child Friendly Secondary Schools (CFSS) where USAID is the only donor providing active support to develop an explicit implementation framework in collaboration with Ministry counterparts. In this respect, ESCUP and the Secondary Education Department actually completed an implementation framework document, which was recently published in Year 4. The program has also documented some key interventions such as the set up of Subject Classrooms and Subject Clubs, which have been dynamic new interventions that have greatly increased the relevance and quality of education at target schools.

6.2 Areas to Address in Future Programming

6.2.1 Supply-Demand Side Constraints and Their Relation to Workplace Skills Training

ESCUP was designed to address needs based on a balanced consideration of both supply-side and demand-side needs within the education sector. Supply-side concerns relate to factors within schools that constrain educational access such as the inadequate supply of teachers, run-down infrastructure and poor penetration of state schools into remote areas. In such cases, demand for education from a large part of the local population already exists, but the primary constraint for such households appeared to be one of educational supply. For another part of the population who exhibit high risk characteristics (e.g., high poverty rate levels, food insecurity, minority ethnicity, etc.), demand for education appeared to be the problem. That is, for such households, education was not a high priority either because they could not afford its costs, could see few benefits from attending, did not perceive there to be culturally relevant subject matter, or other demand-driven factors. Program interventions for this population sought to spike demand by providing subsidies for direct educational costs (e.g., scholarships), hot school breakfasts, and greater cultural sensitization to minority needs (e.g., bilingual classroom assistants) among others. To a large extent, this analysis continues to be valid.

Future programming, however, should bring this analysis further along by looking at a key issue that seems to straddle the supply-side and demand-side divide. This refers to **the absence of a concrete curricular focus in the state schools on workplace readiness skills**. Workplace readiness skills are clearly a demand-side factor because they potentially represent an area of great concern not only among parents but also among young people themselves. This is particularly true at the lower secondary school level and upper primary where over-age enrolment is a wide spread phenomenon (i.e., children are already old enough to start thinking about work). The perception that school is not relevant to the world of work by many young people is clearly an issue that depresses educational demand. On the other hand, the fact that schools are not offering a curricular program that is relevant to workplace preparedness is also a supply-side issue since it is the schools that must make the needed changes to meet student needs and interests. To some extent, many educational programs have sought to address issues of educational relevance, but these efforts have mainly taken the form of improvements in classroom instruction that focus mainly on numeracy and literacy skills. While these efforts are certainly important, they are often seen as rather abstract and very long-term, even in cases where they might actually be occurring. This is not to underestimate the importance of such improvements, but rather to suggest that schools need to do more in the way of very concrete improvements that have more direct relevance to young people, particularly those in the higher grades. This, therefore, means moving beyond simple improvements in the classroom but also including training in issues relating to career counseling, prevocational training, job searches, safe migration, and others.

The above observations are not intended to oversimplify the issue of why children leave school. Certainly, the issue of dropout is very complex and educational relevance is but one of many contributing factors in the decision by a large number of children not to continue with their education. Nevertheless, there is much to be said about the likely potency of efforts to work with state schools to better highlight the curricular topics of great relevance to young people, such as workplace preparedness. In addition, efforts to link greater educational relevance with improved income potential of households (e.g., through family food production linked with the agricultural life skills training) may also encourage parents to put a higher value on education. Such efforts are very likely to not only heighten interest of young people in a state education but also heighten the engagement of parents when they see such concrete benefits. This is particularly true of agricultural skills training activities in this day and age of sky-rocketing food costs.

A review of dropout patterns in the basic education sector indicates that the decision to leave school tends to intensify at the upper primary level and in lower secondary school. Indeed, dropout levels at national level leap from the low teens at primary level to the mid-20s at lower secondary school in terms of percentage incidence. Similarly, transition rates to lower secondary schools in many districts are well below the national average, either in total or among females. These patterns demonstrate the pressures that children encounter to leave school and seek employment in the marketplace, as the val-

ue of their labor increases with age.

These patterns in enrolment, transition, and dropout suggest that it makes sense that there should be a strategic shift in programming to focus on children at upper primary and lower secondary school levels. Such interventions may stress the need to keep children in school or failing that, to ensure that they are prepared to succeed in the workplace after they leave school. These interventions will need to address not only basic numeracy and literacy issues but also more practical skills that may include workplace readiness (such as work immersion experiences), Information Technology skills, and various prevocational skills ranging from sewing, hair cutting, bicycle repair, and innovative agricultural techniques.

6.2.2 Addressing the Need for Improved School Governance

The MoEYS has identified “enabling environments” as a Sixth Dimension under the Child Friendly School (CFS) programming framework. This refers to the need to ensure that the management of schools supports and facilitates school improvement planning and implementation. When management capacity is lacking, investments in development are at serious risk due to misuse of funds, inadequate transparency, poor communication with communities, teachers, and students, and generally poor understanding of why interventions might be needed. As noted earlier, management capacity among schools is highly variable, which requires careful assessment before site identification (and possible rejection of a site) as well as the implementation of properly designed capacity building activities aimed at improving management potential (where such potential exists). There is also a need to heighten the awareness of officials at all levels that development assistance may be denied when poor governance standards are not addressed. It is intended that this will serve to reduce the sense of complacency that exists in the sector regarding school management issues.

6.2.3 Addressing Certain Prerequisites as a Precondition for Development

One of the important experiences of the ESCUP Program in education has been the realization of the need to modulate assistance based on a school’s readiness to receive development aid. Interventions focusing on quality in particular require certain prerequisites to be in place before such interventions can have any impact. For example, widespread teacher shortages and the resulting high Pupil Teacher Ratios (PTR) in classrooms usually undermine interventions to promote child-centered learning. Similarly, high dropout rates, minority disaffection and language proficiency issues, access issues for the physically challenged and the poor, run down infrastructure, and/or poorly defined roles for communities in education can all undermine interventions to improve quality. In this respect, interventions focused on classroom improvements will be affected by class sizes or rundown infrastructure. At the same time, limitations in access issues will likely ensure that only the most well-off members of the community will benefit from implemented interventions if no measures are undertaken to address these issues (i.e., those that have the best attendance and who are least likely to leave school). Thus, there is a need for programming to focus on establishing certain pre-requisites as a precondition for assistance. These prerequisites include: (i) reasonable class sizes and teacher availability; (ii) community engagement; (iii) equal access for marginalized groups including minorities, girls, and the physically challenged; (iv) cultural sensitivity to minority needs where such minority groups exist; and (v) basic infrastructure (e.g., water and sanitation interventions, classrooms that can be locked and secured so that teaching aids may be placed inside, etc.).

6.2.4 Adopting a Multi-Tiered Approach to Development

Because the readiness of schools to receive development assistance is likely to be highly variable depending on external conditions described above, programming interventions need to be modulated to match these different operating conditions. Some schools may demonstrate a high level of readiness to receive interventions designed to promote ‘excellence’ in learning and teaching. These interventions may include intensive activities aimed at improving classroom environments, IT instruction, or advanced life skills programming. This situation suggests the need for a multi-tiered approach to development that addresses school needs based on where they are along a continuum of development readiness.

ANNEX 1: Performance Monitoring Plan

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
ACCESS & QUALITY COMPONENT					
Result A: Schools and clusters are able to identify children at risk (both in and out of school) using the appropriate criteria for selection.	1 All target schools have developed school maps.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ School maps ○ Site visit reports ○ Qrtly Program Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary schools 	Clusters will submit photocopied maps of each satellite school in the cluster. These maps should indicate the locations of children who are out of school.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Teachers, community members, and district officials exhibit sufficient interest in participating in the program to undertake mapping activities.
	2 6,800 or more primary school children are identified in local surveys as being at risk and eligible for scholarship assistance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports ○ Local survey data 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary School children ○ Disaggregated by sex 	Local school-community committees will continue to receive training to carry out student surveys that establish risk status. Committees will identify selected students through a ranking exercise based on the scores received. Information will be reported to clusters for tabulation & onward reporting.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Local committees apply procedures and selection criteria in a valid manner.
	3 1,100 children or more at lower secondary school level have been identified for eligibility for scholarship assistance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lower secondary school students ○ Disaggregated by sex 	See Indicator 2 above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Local committees apply procedures and selection criteria in a valid manner.
	4 At least 20% of those targeted for scholarship assistance at all levels are from minority groups.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Minority students ○ Disaggregated by sex 	Clusters will be asked to submit reports to ESCUP's Information Management System (IMS) that break down beneficiaries by minority status. The names of children will be reported to clusters for tabulation & onward reporting.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate reporting by schools and clusters.
	5 At least 1,200 disabled children identified in local surveys are targeted for service referral by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Physically challenged children ○ Disaggregated by sex 	Schools will receive training in the use of a survey instrument developed by ESCUP to document children with physical disabilities and health ailments. These reports will be complemented by on-site screening by ESCUP staff members. The names of these children will be reported to clusters for tabulation and onward reporting.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate reporting by schools and clusters.
	6 5,500 children or more with learning difficul-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ School reports on 1st Term 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Children with learning difficul- 	At the beginning of the 2 nd semester, schools will identify children with failing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Internal student assessment conducted in schools during the 1st

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
	ties are identified for assistance by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ testing ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ ties ○ Disaggregated by sex 	averages based on 1 st semester scores. The names of these children will be reported to clusters for tabulation and onward reporting.	semester is valid.
	7 Schools for interventions relating to language proficiency difficulties are identified.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Language Proficiency Surveys 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary schools 	ESCUP developed a language proficiency survey instrument in 2006 in collaboration with CARE International. This instrument will be administered in additional schools that do not yet have any language-focused interventions but where it is known there are large concentrations of minority children. Schools that register high deficits in terms of children's Khmer Language proficiency will be noted and reported to LCSCs to help inform the annual planning process.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ LCSCs put a high priority on the needs of minority children enrolled in member schools and allocate cluster grants to solving these needs through the implementation of language-focused interventions (e.g., BCA, SKL, etc.).
Result B: Interventions designed to increase access and quality are implemented effectively.	8 At least 65% of primary schools report declines in dropout from baseline levels by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ School reports ○ Site reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary schools 	Provincial Working Groups will coordinate the compilation of statistical reports with clusters. Clusters will submit statistical reports that use standardized forms relating to various efficiency indicators including dropout in August, 2007 and again in August 2008. The total number of schools reporting a decline in dropout against the number of schools assisted will be included in regular reporting. ESCUP will not use EMIS Yearbooks to satisfy this indicator because (i) dropout is not indicated across all grades; (ii) the lowest unit of reporting by EMIS is at cluster and not school level; and (iii) EMIS tends to under report dropout by counting dropouts who enroll the following year as repeaters.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate and timely reporting by schools.
	9 At least 40% of those outside of the school system (based on mapping results) are enrolled with scholarship support each year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Out-of-school children ○ Disaggregated by sex and minority status 	Clusters will be asked to tabulate the total number of out-of-school children who have been identified through mapping exercises and the total number who have been enrolled. This data compilation will focus in particular on children enrolled in ICRs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Promised benefits to out-of-school children provide enough of an incentive for them to re-enroll. ○ ICRs are optimally placed to make education accessible to the maximum number of children

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
	10 At least 60% of the children out of school who are enrolled are girls, disabled, or come from minority groups each year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Girls ○ Physically challenged children ○ Minority children 	All out-of-school children will be recorded in STS at the beginning of each academic year. Analyses will be carried out to determine what % of these children are girls, disabled, or from minority groups. Because these groups will overlap, the analysis will be undertaken in a way so that the total % who are girls is calculated first followed by an analysis of what % of the remainder come from the other 2 groups.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Data collection relating to children out-of-school is carried in an accurate and timely manner.
Result B: Interventions designed to increase access and quality are implemented effectively. (con't)	11 At least 7,000 children receive primary school scholarships in all grades during program implementation from 2004/5 - 2007/8.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary school scholarship recipients ○ Disaggregated by sex 	All LCSCs will submit name lists of the children receiving scholarships to site offices. This information will be forwarded to STS for data entry. STS will generate reports indicating the total number of beneficiaries. Data entries will be cross-referenced with other interventions to ensure that children are not counted twice	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ LCSC reports are both accurate and timely.
	12 Transition rates to lower secondary school increase from a baseline in 70% or more of target schools each year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lower secondary school reports ○ Site reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lower secondary schools 	Each target secondary school will be asked to complete two special forms developed by KAPE that indicate enrolment in feeder schools at Grade 6 in 2004/5 (baseline) and 2006/7 (Form B) as well as total intake for Grade 7 at that particular secondary school in 2007/8 (Form C). Rates will be calculated on the basis of these two enrolment figures.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A majority of feeder schools rely on only one secondary school for transition purposes. ○ LSMC reports are both accurate and timely. ○ Emergence of Basic Education schools do not siphon off too many students who would normally transfer to ESCUP target schools.
	13 At least 85% of scholarship beneficiaries at all levels remain enrolled each year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Scholarship beneficiaries ○ Disaggregated by sex 	LCSCs and LSMCs will submit quarterly reports on the number of scholarship beneficiaries who drop out of the program. This information will be entered into the STS and compared against total beneficiaries.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ LCSC and LSMC reports are both accurate and timely.
	14 At least 1,200 physically challenged children identified in surveys receive some form of assistance from service providers by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Physically challenged children ○ Disaggregated by sex 	ESCUP staff have already carried out a baseline survey on physically challenged children and those with chronic illnesses. Based on this list of children, ESCUP Program staff will determine those children to be referred to service providers. Program managers will seek discounts from service	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Travel conditions permit penetration of remote areas for pick-up and referral interventions. ○ Communes, school directors, and community members are aware of those children who are need medical care..

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
				providers such as the provincial hospital in order to ensure a quota of 500 beneficiaries can be supported with the grant funds allocated.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provincial hospitals in Kratie and Mondulkiri provide discounts as has been done in Kampong Cham.
	15 80% or more of the disabled children who receive assistance stay enrolled each academic year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Site reports Student Tracking System Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Physically challenged children Disaggregated by sex 	STS records will be updated at least twice during the 2007/8 school year to ascertain which disabled students are still in school. School directors will receive STS generated student lists, which they must complete, indicating the disabled students who are still enrolled. In addition, Child-to-child networks in schools with high concentrations of disabled children will be developed to ensure social integration into the school body and enhanced prospects for retention.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enrollment reports based on STS generated name lists are completed accurately by school directors. Parents can be persuaded to keep their children enrolled.
Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicators	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
Result B: Interventions designed to increase access and quality are implemented effectively. (con't)	16 PTR declines in at least 75% of target schools by the end of Year 3.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> District & Cluster reports ESCUP surveys 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary Schools 	Following the posting of community teachers to remote schools with teacher shortages, PWGs will coordinate compilation of statistical reports relating to enrolment & teacher numbers with all schools. Program staff will compare total enrolment data in schools with total teachers (both state & community) to determine current PTR levels. This will be done for each academic year at the end of the 1 st Term when community teacher arrangements have been completed. Current PTR levels will be compared with those reported in the 2004/5 baseline year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting by districts and clusters is timely and accurate. Ministry and ESCUP have reached agreement on the recruitment and assignment of community teachers to incomplete schools in remote areas.
	17 25% or more incomplete schools add at least 1 grade from baseline by the end of program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cluster and District Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incomplete primary schools 	PWGs will coordinate the compilation of statistical reports with clusters. Clusters will submit statistical reports relating to the number of incomplete schools, which have been able to add a grade since the 2004/05 baseline year. This survey will be undertaken in March 2008. The total number of	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting by districts and clusters is timely and accurate. Ministry and ESCUP have reached agreement on the recruitment and assignment of community teachers and PTTC graduates formerly supported by the program to in-

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
				schools reporting an increase against the total number of targeted incomplete schools assisted under the program will be calculated and included in regular reporting.	complete schools in remote areas.
	18 75% of minority children receiving interventions designed to improve language proficiency stay in school each academic year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program survey reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Minority children ○ Disaggregated by sex 	Each year, the number of schools requesting technical and material assistance for language proficiency interventions increases (e.g., Bilingual Classroom Assistants, SKL, etc.). At the end of the 2007/8 academic year, ESCUP will compare changes in repetition and dropout rates across all children in comparison to baseline data for each school.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Quasi-bilingual interventions are effectively implemented. ○ Repetition and dropout data reported by schools is timely and accurate.
	19 Children studying in new CFS classrooms at Grades 1, 5, and 6 improve their performance from a baseline in critical and creative thinking by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Achievement Test Results in Khmer Language and Mathematics 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mean scores for the sample of selected schools 	A random sample will be constructed of schools with new Grade 1 classrooms. Achievement tests that focus on critical thinking skills administered in the form of one-on-one interviews will occur at the end of the 2007/8 academic year. These will be compared with baseline mean scores from tests that were administered at the end of 2006/7.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Tests can measure critical thinking skills in a valid manner. ○ The administration of tests occurs under conditions that ensure reliable measurement.
	20 At least 50,000 children are enrolled in USAID supported primary schools by 2007/8 (20)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cluster and District Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary school children 	At the beginning and end of 2007/8, all target primary schools will be asked to fill out a standard form (Form A) indicating the total number of children enrolled with disaggregation by sex and grade.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate and timely reporting by primary schools.
	21 At least 11,000 children are enrolled in USAID supported secondary schools by 2007/8 .	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lower secondary school reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Lower secondary school children 	At the beginning and end of 2007/8, all target lower secondary schools will be asked to fill out a standard form (Form C) indicating the total number of children enrolled with disaggregation by sex and grade.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate and timely reporting by lower secondary schools.
	22 At least 6,370 children in Grade 5 in USAID supported schools complete the grade by the	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Cluster and District Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Grade 5 children 	Upon submitting a standard data collection form at the end of the 2007/8 academic year by all schools (Form A), program staff will make a determination of the total number	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Accurate and timely reporting by primary schools. ○ Satisfactory fulfillment of this indicator assumes continuous sup-

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
	end of 2007/8			completing the grade. ESCUP will also try to make a determination of cohort survival over a 5-year cycle if enrolment data is available for Grade 1 enrolment since the 2003/4 academic year (the year of initial cohort enrolment).	port to schools over a 5-year cycle. As USAID has only agreed to provide support for 3 years, it is hoped that this will have been enough to show impact on completion rates.
	23 At least 7,800 children in Grade 6 in USAID supported schools complete the primary cycle by the end of 2007/8	○ Cluster and District Reports	○ Grade 6 children	Upon submitting a standard data collection form at the end of the 2007/8 academic year by all schools (Form A), program staff will make a determination of the total number completing the grade. ESCUP will also try to make a determination of cohort survival over a 6-year cycle if enrolment data is available for Grade 1 enrolment since the 2002/3 academic year (the year of initial cohort enrolment).	○ Accurate and timely reporting by primary schools. ○ Satisfactory fulfillment of this indicator assumes continuous support to schools over a 6-year cycle. As USAID has only agreed to provide support for 3 years, it is hoped that this will have been enough to show impact on completion rates.
Result C: The learning achievement of slow learners improves as the result of remedial interventions.	24 At least 50% of those designated as slow learners are promoted each academic year.	○ Site reports ○ Student Tracking System Reports	○ Slow learners ○ Disaggregated by sex	Program staff will compile the total number of children enrolled in remedial classes across all clusters and the number of these children who pass 2 nd Term examinations.	○ Internal student assessment activities conducted by schools at the end of the year are valid.
	25 Student repetition rates decline from a baseline in at least 60% of target schools by the end of the program.	○ Cluster and District Reports	○ Primary schools	PWGs will coordinate the compilation of statistical reports with clusters. Clusters will submit statistical reports relating to various efficiency indicators including repetition in Aug, 2007 and again in August 2008. The number of schools reporting a decline in repetition against baseline levels will be calculated & included in regular reporting. The program will not be using EMIS Yearbooks to satisfy this indicator because EMIS over reports repetition by counting dropouts from previous year who re-enroll as repeaters.	○ Accurate and timely reporting by primary schools.
Result D: Educational provision in schools is more relevant to student needs.	26 At least 50% of target schools provide more relevant education in the form of local life skills activities by the end of the program.	○ Site reports ○ Cluster School Improvement Plans	○ Primary schools ○ Lower secondary schools	Based on site reports, program staff will compile the number of schools providing LLSP provisions in comparison with the total number of target schools in the program.	○ Community and school LLSP instructors are effective in their educational provision.

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
	27 50% or more of target schools achieve a score of 'satisfactory' or better on a standardized instrument measuring educational relevance by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A specialized form measuring educational relevance developed by ESCUP 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary Schools ○ Lower Secondary Schools 	Program staff will administer a standardized Assessment Tool developed for the purpose across all target primary schools and lower secondary schools each year. Determinations of relevance are based on the occurrence of at least 5 of any 12 designated activities in a school (e.g., life skills, field trips, learning corners, etc.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Assessment Tools are valid with respect to what they purport to measure. ○ Assessment Tools are administered by program staff in a way that ensures its reliability. ○ Educational relevance criteria can be achieved within a 3-year implementation period.
	28 75% of CFS experimental classrooms meet criteria defining child friendliness by the end of the program. (28)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program survey tools 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Grade 1 classrooms 	ESCUP has developed a survey instrument that assesses the 'child friendliness' of physical classroom organization based on criteria relating to the availability and appropriateness of classroom displays (e.g., height of posters), provisions for group work (e.g., availability of materials), seating arrangements, and general sanitation in the classroom. This assessment will take place during March 2008.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Assessment Tools are valid with respect to what they purport to measure. ○ Classroom observations are conducted in a valid/reliable manner. ○ The distribution of materials for CFS classrooms is timely in nature. ○ Teachers are motivated to use the materials provided to improve the physical environments of their classrooms.
TEACHER EDUCATION COMPONENT					
Result A: Classroom practice becomes more child-centered in comparison to a previously established baseline.	29 All community teachers remaining after integration of locally recruited PTTC graduates receive follow up support from technical program staff. (29)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Technical reports for Teacher Education Component ○ Teacher profile reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Community Teachers 	Program management will review component technical reports to ensure that at least 3 follow-up workshops occur during the 2007/8 academic year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Component staff have enough resources (both in terms of time and money) and personnel to fulfill this expectation.
Result A: Classroom practice becomes more child-centered in comparison to a previously established baseline. (con't)	30 Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of Community Teachers meets an absolute standard for performance each year. (31)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Observation scores from a classroom observation instrument designed for the purpose 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Community teachers 	A Community Teaching Practice Observation tool was developed under ESCUP I to assess this indicator based on an absolute standard of performance. Core elements of the tool will emphasize criteria that define good teaching. A sample will be randomly constructed each year that comprises at least 10% of the Community Teachers who have been trained. It is expected that at least half of these will meet an absolute standard of	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Classroom observation tools are valid in what they purport to measure. ○ Classroom observations are conducted in a valid and reliable manner. ○ Sample construction results in a representative sample of teachers.

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
				performance.	
	31 Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of Multi-grade teachers becomes more child-centered in comparison to a baseline each year. (32)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Observation scores from a classroom observation instrument designed for the purpose 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Multi-grade teachers 	A sample will be constructed randomly that comprises teachers who receive technical support for multi-grade teaching. The assessment tool developed for this purpose will focus on key elements of good multi-grade teaching practice. A detailed report will be prepared by ESCUP staff that includes a description of the number of teachers receiving a particular technical input, the specific kinds of teacher education interventions implemented, and a summary of all observation outcomes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Classroom observation tools are valid in what they purport to measure. ○ Classroom observations are conducted in a valid and reliable manner. ○ Sample construction results in a representative sample of teachers.
	32 At least 400 teachers in selected remote area schools receive technical support (for experimental CFS and CFSS classrooms) by the end of the program. (33)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ LCSC reports ○ Secondary school reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Primary and secondary school teachers 	Participant lists comprising all teachers receiving training will be developed by program staff in collaboration with provincial working groups. These lists will be reported to LCSCs and secondary schools for forward reporting to site offices where they will be tabulated and summarized.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Teachers selected to participate in the in-service program are motivated and trainable.
	33 Classroom practice among 50% of a sample of CFS Experimental Classroom Teachers becomes more child-centered by the end of the program (34)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Observation scores from a classroom observation instrument designed for the purpose 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ CFS primary school teachers 	The assessment tool developed for this purpose will focus on general elements of good teaching practice. The assessment tool will look at classroom environments, teaching, and learning. In administering this tool, a random sample of CFS teachers that comprises at least 10% of the target population will be constructed. A total score across all parameters will be the basis for satisfying this indicator.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Classroom observation tools are valid in what they purport to measure. ○ Classroom observations are conducted in a valid and reliable manner. ○ Sample construction results in a representative sample of teachers.
	34 At least 80% of SKL/BCA teachers achieve proficiency in the use of targeted techniques by the end of the program. (35)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Observation scores from a classroom observation instrument designed for the purpose 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ SKL teachers ○ BCAs 	ESCUP will develop a special classroom observation tool that will be used with selected teachers and BCAs who have received training. Depending on the number of teachers who participate in SKL/BCA activities, those observed may either be a sample of all teachers/assistants or, in the case of a small population, all those participating.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Classroom observation tools are valid in what they purport to measure. ○ Classroom observations are conducted in a valid and reliable manner.

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
Result B: The Teacher Education System at PTTC level is more responsive to the needs of remote communities	36 At least 165 locally recruited candidates have been admitted to PTTCs and remain enrolled by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ TTD name lists of accepted candidates ○ Candidate application forms 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ PTTC candidates ○ Disaggregated by sex 	ESCUP will use name lists of passing candidates reported by TTD against the original name lists of applying candidates as validation of the intake quota of 100 PTTC candidates to be supported by the program. <u>Note:</u> No change in status for this indicator (which was achieved under ESCUP I) is expected.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ There are enough eligible candidates (i.e., those who have completed Grade 12) in target areas to fill quotas. ○ A majority of candidates from target areas in rural/remote communities can successfully complete the PTTC entrance examination. ○ No new intakes occur for PTTC entry that will receive support from ESCUP.
	37 At least 35% of locally recruited PTTC teacher candidates are from minority groups (Cham and hill tribe groups). (37)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ TTD name lists of accepted candidates ○ Candidate application forms 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ PTTC candidates ○ Disaggregated by minority status 	Name lists of those applying will be structured in order to accommodate information relating to minority status. In the event that government application forms do not disclose this information, ESCUP staff will make special inquiries among passing students with respect to their minority status. <u>Note:</u> No change in status for this indicator (which was only partially achieved under ESCUP I) is expected.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Minority groups are interested in applying for PTTC entry. ○ Minority candidates are eligible for PTTC entry (i.e., they have studied to Grade 12). ○ Local patronage networks do not impede minority recruitment. ○ No new intakes occur for PTTC entry that will receive support from ESCUP.
SCHOOL-COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP COMPONENT					
Result A: Communities demonstrate active participation in the instructional program of target schools.	38 At least 230 Community Teachers have been identified by local communities of whom 35% or more are comprised of minority groups by the end of the program. (38)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site reports ○ CEFAC & LCSC reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Community Teachers ○ Disaggregated by sex 	CEFACs and LCSCs will receive a standardized template for recording Community Teacher candidates that have been selected. These completed lists will be signed and authorized by all local committees and returned to provincial coordinators who will in turn convey these to ESCUP central offices for tabulation. <u>Note:</u> No change in status for this indicator (which was only partially achieved under ESCUP I) is expected.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ It is possible to find suitable candidates as Community Teachers who are willing to work for the stipend provided. ○ Local communities are able to implement the recruitment guidelines provided.
	39 At least 165 locally recruited candidates from target areas have been admitted to PTTCs and remained enrolled by the end of the pro-	See Indicator 36 above.			

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
	gram.				
	40 90 % of local reports indicate community participation in one or more of the following activity channels each year: LLSP, CT recruitment & mgt, teacher recruitment for PTTC entry, & school mapping. (Note: In areas where the activity is occurring.) (40)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Activity Participation Lists o LCSC & CE-FAC reports o Site reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Community-level reports (i.e., CE-FAC or SSC) 	Tracking tools used to monitor this indicator will consist primarily of participation lists in the various activities mentioned above including the total number of community members recruited to teach life skills (including work as classroom assistants), who apply for PTTC entry, assist in advertising/recruiting campaigns for various purposes (e.g., community teachers, PTTC candidates, etc.), and who conduct mapping exercises.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Community members are motivated to participate in selected program activities.
	41 80% of Community Teacher Mgt Boards meet criteria for effectiveness each year. (41)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Community Teacher Mgt Board Survey data 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Community Teacher Mgt Boards 	The School-Community Partnership Component has developed an assessment instrument under ESCUP I (a checklist) that reviews the management effectiveness of management boards according to several criteria that relate to tasks explained during capacity-building workshops. This instrument covers such criteria as the regularity of monitoring, punctuality of payment, financial record keeping, reporting, and problem solving. This instrument will be administered at the end of each academic term in order to monitor improvement.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Survey instruments are valid in what they purport to measure. o Surveys are conducted in a valid and reliable manner.
Result B: Schools are more sensitized to the diverse cultural needs of their students.	42 A majority of respondents in an attitudinal survey demonstrate satisfaction with educational provision according to an absolute standard by the end of the program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Attitudinal Survey Forms 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Sampled community members within target areas o Disaggregated by sex 	An attitudinal survey instrument dealing with the quality of educational provision was developed under ESCUP I and has already been administered several times. This instrument will be administered for a final time towards the end of 2007/8 academic year to gauge community satisfaction levels against an absolute standard of expectations (i.e., there will be no baseline for this indicator).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Survey instruments are valid in what they purport to measure. o Attitudinal survey instruments are administered in a valid and reliable manner. o Security conditions permit penetration of communities in target areas.

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions	
		Sources	Data Units	Methods		
PROGRAM MANAGEMENT COMPONENT						
Result A: Local education structures (e.g., clusters, lower secondary schools) and local government (e.g., communes) demonstrate ability to plan and implement interventions to improve access & quality.	43	All clusters, lower secondary schools, PTTCs, and CEFACs provide improvement plans that meet criteria for funding and implement subsequently allocated grants according to prescribed criteria by the beginning of each academic year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site visit reports by program staff ○ Grant liquidation documentation ○ Activity assessment instrument results ○ Quarterly Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ LCSCs ○ CEFACs ○ Lower secondary schools 	School and CEFAC improvement plans will be reviewed and assessed according to fixed criteria. Implementation of activities will be assessed using standardized assessment tools developed for each core activity. Performance results will feed into quarterly reporting.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The management potential of each school & commune is at a level where interventions designed to build capacity in planning and grant management can have some impact. ○ In cases where local managers are untrainable, PoE, and DoE officials can make personnel adjustments.
	44	All clusters, lower secondary schools, PTTCs & CEFACs submit requests for grants and properly liquidate those requests each year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Monthly funding requests from schools and local communities ○ Grant liquidation documentation ○ Quarterly Reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ LCSCs ○ CEFACs ○ Lower secondary schools 	Fund request and liquidation forms are standardized and will provide a useful form of documentation to validate the achievement of this indicator across all clusters, secondary schools, and CEFACs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Result B: Mechanisms are in place to collect data on program effectiveness.	45	All data collection tools developed in the first 2 years are reviewed and revised by the beginning of the 2007/8 academic year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program Monitoring Framework 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Discrete data collection instruments 	A new member of staff who will take special responsibility for information management matters will undertake a review of all data collection instruments at the beginning of the 2007/8 academic year and make recommendations accordingly.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
	46	The Student Tracking System developed by the US Dept of Labor has been adapted to fit the needs of ESCUP and is used by project staff and counterparts for student tracking. (46)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program documents 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable 	Satisfaction of this indicator will be met when the adapted STS is in place with special provisions to track children from vulnerable groups and participation in ESCUP-specific in-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable

Intermediate Results	Relevant Indicator	Means of Verification			Risks & Assumptions
		Sources	Data Units	Methods	
				<p>terventions.</p> <p><u>Note:</u> No change is expected in this indicator (which was already achieved under ESCUP I).</p>	
<p>Result C: Lessons learned are documented and disseminated.</p>	<p>47 At least 5 school/ community representatives from each cluster/lower secondary school visit other sites for purposes of professional development during each academic year.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program documents ○ Study tour follow-up reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ School representatives ○ Community members 	<p>Site visits will be highly structured with orientations preceding each visit. During these orientations, visitors will identify questions to ask and issues to investigate. Upon return to the school, cluster or community, study participants will submit reports about what they learned and what action they may take in their own school improvement frameworks. These reports should be presented to the appropriate stakeholders (e.g., commune councils, LCSCs, etc.)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Selection of those participating in study tours leads to the participation of motivated and professional educators.
	<p>48 A formal presentation is provided to Ministry and provinces describing the results and outcomes of the program at the end of the program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program documents ○ Slide presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable 	<p>Satisfaction of this indicator will be met through the development of a visual presentation for Ministry officials at the end of the program in August or September 2008.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program can show impacts on terminal indicators before the end of 2007/8. ○ MoEYS expresses interest in program results.
	<p>49 Representatives from DoE and PoEs visit each target cluster and high school during each program year.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program documents 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ DoE and PoE representatives 	<p>Compliance with this indicator will be monitored through site reporting and regular planning documents.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ DoE and PoE members show interest and motivation in learning about the program. ○ MoEYS expresses interest in program results.

ANNEX 2: Operational Plan Indicator Final Review (2008)

Program Activity Summary

Date: 31 March 2008

Contractor/Grantee: American Institutes for Research & World Education **Cooperative Agreement No.:** GDG-A-00-03-00006-00

Activity Title: Educational Support to Children in Underserved Populations (ESCUP II)

Contract/Grant Amount (US\$):	\$4,451,887	Activity Start Date:	1 April 2005
Obligated Amount:	\$4,451,887	Activity Finish Date:	30 Sept 2008
Pipeline (unspent of \$ obligated):	\$ 0 (as of 1 Oct 08)		

Goals and Objectives:

- The overall goal of ESCUP is to increase access to a basic education of quality by underserved groups including the poorest of the poor, disabled children, girls, and minority groups.
- A related goal is to promote children's rights through the Child Friendly School approach that has been developed by MoEYS over the years.

Indicators (OP Indicators Only)	Target	Actual
1. Number of learners enrolled in USG supported primary schools or equivalent non-school based settings	27,010 (M) 24,897 (F) 51,907 (T)	26,094 (M) 25,249 (F) 51,343 (T)
2. Number of learners enrolled in USG supported secondary schools or equivalent non-school based settings	5,585 (M) 4,855 (F) 10,440 (T)	5,505 (M) 4,895 (F) 10,400 (T)
3. Learners completing fifth grade in USAID supported primary schools	(No target specified)	--
4. Learners completing primary cycle (class 6) in USAID supported schools	(No target specified)	--
5. Number of teachers/educators trained with USG support	243 (M) 170 (F) 413 (T)	275 (M) 189 (F) 464 (T)
6. Number of parent-teacher associations or similar 'school' governance structures supported	166	166
7. Number of classrooms repaired with USG assistance	125	125
8. Number of classrooms constructed with USG assistance	0	1
9. Schools implementing local life skills modules	83	70
10. Schools reporting a decrease in student repetition.	65%	72% reported declines in Yr 2
11. Schools reporting a decline in student dropout rates.	65%	76% reported declines in Yr 2
12. Students from disadvantaged populations enrolled in school.	6,800	6,814 children

Final Status/Challenges:

- Phase II of ESCUP started in April 2007, following a successful two year run under ESCUP I.
- Important programmatic themes that are being addressed under ESCUP II relate to three key challenges including: (i) Improved Educational Quality, (ii) School Governance, and (iii) Sustainability.
- ESCUP has been most successful in achieving targets that relate to access and retention goals.
- Because quality issues are so often linked with attitudinal factors among teachers and structural problems within the education sector, educational quality appears to be much less amenable to change than are improvements in educational access.
- Among OP Indicators with targets specified, the program has fully achieved 8 out of 9 performance targets.
- Repetition rates have declined in 72% of schools from the baseline during Year 3 (2007/8) (see OP indicator 10).
- 76% of primary schools indicated a decline in the rate of dropout during the last year as well. (see OP indicator 11)
- Of the 49 performance targets specified in the PMP, 42 or 86% have been achieved.
- Issues relating to poor governance are being addressed through high profile reviews of school performance and requests to local authorities for removal of several school directors who have been found to be misusing funds. In some cases, these requests are accommodated but in others, this has proven more difficult, requiring a suspension of assistance to such schools.
- The program has made good progress in localizing certain key interventions such as the use of Community Teachers to address teacher shortages. Since the start of the new school year, 90 project supported teachers (or 40% of the total) have been replaced with locally recruited state teachers who just completed two years of scholarship supported study at the local PTTC. In addition, a growing proportion of bilingual classroom assistants are being replaced with Cham-speaking graduates from the PTTC who also received program-supported scholarships as part of a minority advocacy campaign sponsored by ESCUP.

Lessons Learned:

1. Continuing Research on Issues Relating to the Cham Population

The program supported one of its local partners in doing highly informative research regarding educational access issues as they relate to the Cham minority population in Kampong Cham Province. The study identified growing concerns about disaffection of the Cham population from the state schools, low Khmer language proficiency among young Cham children when they enroll in the state schools, low representation of Chams among state teachers, and the growing propensity of Cham parents to send their children to Islamic Schools, which are growing in number. These findings suggest concern because they undermine the nation-building function of the state schools and highlight the emergence of a parallel school system over which the state has no direct oversight.

2. Review of Approaches to Improve Information Technology (IT) Access to Students at Lower Secondary School Level

ESCUP has been reviewing existing activities to provide access to Information Technology for students, mainly at lower secondary school level where the program has inherited and continues to support earlier interventions started by KAPE. This review has led to the development of a concept paper that summarizes existing protocols for IT provision (mainly through computer labs) and critically reviews the strengths and weaknesses of these existing approaches. The concept paper then puts forward proposed strategies for improving the cost efficiency of providing IT access and strengthening partnerships between agencies that provide IT services, mainly KAPE, World Education, and Room to Read. A primary strategy that the paper strongly suggests for further investigation is the use of thin clients to reduce energy and maintenance requirements while at the same time creating better opportunities for the use of renewable energy sources (such as solar panels) by severely reducing investment costs for labs.

3. Posting of First Batch of PTTC Graduates to Communes of Origin

Discussions to replace Community Teachers with newly graduated PTTC students have been a protracted process in Kratie and Monduliri. Kampong Cham has been the most cooperative province in this regard with complete support from the provincial personnel office to move forward with posting of ESCUP-supported graduates to their communes of origin. The personnel office in Kratie was at first reluctant to comply with expectations to send PTTC scholarship recipients back to their communes of origin but finally agreed, leading to a smooth process of posting to remote areas. The mediation of the Teacher Training Department was crucial in this regard and highly effective. Unfortunately, the provincial personnel office in Monduliri has indicated that it will not be complying with the terms of the contracts negotiated by ESCUP two years ago. The reasons cited by the POE relate to severe teacher shortages in other districts. In spite of strenuous efforts by the Teacher Training Department to mediate this issue, it appears that a compromise will not be possible. PTTC students have indicated that they are going to bring the issue to court, as it was promised in contracts signed that they would be allowed to return to their communes of origin as teachers upon graduation. ESCUP will be monitoring the situation closely to see the outcome. This episode demonstrates the power of personnel offices in the various provinces, the limited leverage of the central Ministry in such cases, and the attenuated meaningfulness of paper contracts in Cambodia.

4. Attrition of CFS Classroom Teachers		
<p>Program planners continue to be concerned about the attrition of CFS teachers in the program. Since the start of ESCUP II, 46 CFS teachers trained last year have left the program. This represents about 29% of all the teachers trained last year (160 in all), at considerable expense to the program. More than a third of those leaving (16 persons) did so in order to move to secondary schools where shortages continue to be severe, particularly as the Ministry expands secondary education provision. Another 14 (or 30%) transferred to other schools while the rest left for a combination of reasons including resignations, retirements, health, or PTTC entry. While it is certain that those teachers moving to other institutions will be able to use what they have learned from the program in their new posts, these statistics demonstrate the chaotic movement of personnel within the education system. It also underlines the difficulty of programs such as ESCUP to work with a stable pool of teachers over a multi-year period to develop their capacity.</p>		
5. Obstacles to Achieving Changes in Classroom Practice		
<p>Recent monitoring visits to CFS classrooms during the review period have again highlighted the need to avoid grand schemes for change in the short-term. While it is true that there are a number of teachers who really seem to understand the substance of the changes sought by the program, these are by far a very small minority. Monitoring reports have indicated that physical changes in classrooms have been achieved to a large extent but that many teachers do not prepare lesson plans nor do they understand well the objectives of the lessons that they are teaching. What observers have noted is that teachers seem to have acquired some mastery of the form of teaching (games, group work, etc) but do not seem to understand why they are using these techniques in their teaching. That is, they have the 'form' but not the real 'substance' of the target methodologies presented in teacher education workshops. These observations explode the often naïve belief that one-off teacher training workshops can have major impacts on teacher practice. In truth, many teachers lack the educational pre-requisites or previous experience needed to grasp many of the concepts presented at workshops. Based on this experience, ESCUP programmers are beginning to step back to re-examine the content of its workshop programming, much of which was borrowed from KAPE to use with more advanced school clusters. The program is, therefore, realizing that many of the concepts presented (such as student portfolios, learning corners, etc) are perhaps too ambitious for teachers in remote schools and that these should be removed from future training programs in favor of more basic methods and techniques (e.g., identifying educational objectives as part of lesson planning).</p>		
6. Long-Term Time Frame Required for Change in Schools		
<p>Although there are a number of schools that are now moving forward rapidly this year in terms of the overall improvements observed in their learning environments, it is important to reflect that these schools did not do well during the first year of program implementation. The bottom-up implementation strategy employed by ESCUP in which stakeholders define their own needs and develop individualized programming based on a review of these needs clearly was not initially well understood. Upon closer inspection, it is probably not surprising that after many decades of being conditioned to do as ordered rather than thinking proactively, many stakeholders found it very difficult to adjust to the new development regime promoted by ESCUP. It took more than a year in many cases before schools and communities were able to start taking advantage of a development approach driven by stakeholders rather than a centrally administered project structure that is so characteristic of many development programs. By Year 3 of program implementation, many stakeholders do appear to have adjusted their thinking and behavioral styles accordingly and are making rapid progress in solving local problems with a strong sense of ownership of the process. Once again, this demonstrates the primacy of local attitudes as a key factor that affects the implementation of development projects and argues for a long-term time frame for such projects rather than one-off dabbling in material and technical support that is generally the norm.</p>		
Synergy/Sub-Awardees:		
<p>ESCUP is being implemented as a cooperative effort involving three international NGOs (American Institutes for Research, World Education, and CARE), and five local NGOs. AIR provides financial management and technical support from its DC office while World Education is responsible for direct program implementation in Cambodia. In keeping with an EQUIP philosophy to integrate programming under one project heading, staff members from all agencies work side by side in shared offices and generally submerge individual agency identities in favor of a coherent program identity. This system has worked well and has enabled management to post staff members from different agencies with particular strengths to areas and events where they are most needed (e.g., life skills, teacher education, information management, scholarship implementation, bilingual education, etc.). This has led to maximal leveraging of the strengths of each agency. This combination of agencies has also enabled local partners to increase their portfolio of expertise in various areas. For example, KAPE has been able to incorporate IPM and bilingual education activities into its programming while WCRD has benefited from assistance from KAPE to set up scholarship programs and health care referral systems.</p>		
Geographic Focus/Target Populations:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o The program is working in 4 provinces: Kampong Cham, Kratie, Mondulkir, and Ratanakiri, encompassing 166 primary schools and 19 lower secondary schools (5 CARE-supported schools in Ratanakiri have been added to the 14 assisted in the original 3 ESCUP Provinces) o The focus of the program is on remote schools and the following groups: (i) the poorest of the poor; (ii) girls; (iii) disabled children; (iv) minority groups (Chams, hilltribe groups). o All interventions are aimed at the formal basic education sector (Primary and Lower Secondary School) 		
Contacts:	Title	Email Address:
Kurt Bredenberg	Title: Chief of Party	kurtb.worlded@online.com.kh
Adela Mizrachi	Title: Program Manager	amizrachi@air.org